Culture Unbound:

Journal of Current Cultural Research

Independent Articles

Volume 11, Issue 2 2019

Linköping University Electronic Press
Culture Unbound: ISSN 2000-1525 (online)
URL: http://www.cultureunbound.ep.liu.se/

Culture Unbound, **Volume 11, 2019**

Culture Unbound
Journal of Current Cultural Research

Heritage Churches as Post-Christian Sacred Spaces: Reflections on the Significance of Government Protection of Ecclesiastical Heritage in Swedish National and Secular Self-Identity

By Tobias Harding

Abstract

Sweden is often described as a country where secularization has come comparatively far. At the same time, state and church have remained relatively close, especially before the enactment of the decisions of increased separation of church and state in 2000. Sweden is also a country where the built heritage of the established church enjoys a strong legal protection. When relations between the state and the established church were reformed in 2000, this protection was left in place. This article offers an analysis of the significance ascribed to ecclesiastical heritage in the form of Church of Sweden heritage churches in government policy, focusing on the process leading up to the separation of church and state in year 2000. Using Mircea Eliade's understanding of the sacred and the profane as a starting point for my analysis, I contextualize the significance of heritage churches is in the wider context of a post-Christian, and more specifically post-Lutheran, secularized society. I suggest that the ongoing heritagization of Church of Sweden's church buildings could be seen as a process where they are decontextualized from the denominationally-specific religiosity of the Church of Sweden, but rather than being re-contextualized only as secular heritage, they could be more clearly understood as becoming the sacred places, and objects, of a post-Lutheran civil religion and generalized religiosity, i.e. not simply a disenchantment, but also a re-enchantment. This could be understood as a continuation of traditions of approaching memory, and the sacred, developed in a society characterized by the near hegemony of the established church in the religious sphere, but also in partially counter-clerical movements, such as the Romantic movement.

Keywords: sacred and profane, sacred places, heritagization, secularization, post-Christian, post-Lutheran, religious heritage, heritage policy, Sweden.

Harding, Tobias: "Heritage Churches as Post-Christian Sacred Spaces: Reflections on the Significance of Government Protection of Ecclesiastical Heritage in Swedish National and Secular Self-Identity", *Culture Unbound*, Volume 11, issue 2, 2019: 209–230. Published by Linköping University Electronic Press: http://www.culture-unbound.ep.liu.se

> The Swedish parish churches constitute a cultural heritage built over a period of nearly a millennium. There are over 3000 church buildings, representing the architecture, building history, and building technologies of numerous epochs. Church interiors and objects are, taken together, a cultural treasure, which, in richness and scope, surpasses what is collected in Swedish museums.
>
> The church buildings represent fundamental aspects of Swedish social, economic and political history. From medieval to modern times, the parish has been the framework of local society (Ministry of Culture 1994: 125).

What happens to the symbolical buildings of traditional religion in the process of secularization? Sweden is often seen as a country where secularization has gone comparatively far. Only a minority of its inhabitants believes in God in a traditional manner, and religious references play a comparatively limited role in public discourse. At the same time, Sweden is a country where a majority of the population has chosen to remain members of the Church of Sweden, a historically established church (Thurfjäll 2015, Bromander 2013, cf. Taylor 2007), and where the state and the established church have remained close, especially until the increased separation of church and state in 2000. It is also a country where the physical heritage of the established church, in the form of church buildings and churchyards, enjoys a strong legal protection (Harding 2016a). When the reform of relations between the Church of Sweden and the state, which took place in 2000, was prepared, there appears to have been a broad consensus that this protection should remain. This was, for example, made clear by the government report that started the process in 1994, as illustrated by the quote above, favorably comparing this national cultural heritage to that preserved in the country's museums. So far, heritage churches has remained a category specifically protected by heritage law, with legal regulation protecting all churches built for the established national church before 1940, and used by it up to 2000, even after equal treatment of religious denominations became enshrined in the fundamental law (cf. Harding 2016a).

This article offers an analysis of the significance ascribed to ecclesiastical heritage in the form of Church of Sweden heritage churches in government policy documents, focusing on the process leading up to the separation of church and state in year 2000, and on the on reasons given for continuing to prioritize protecting and preserving ecclesiastic heritage specifically in the form of heritage churches. The article thus ads to the growing bodies of research focusing on the complex relation between secular and sacred created through the process of secularization (e.g. Casanova 1994, 2014, Sundback 2007, Josephson-Storm 2017, Taylor 2007, Thurfjell 2015, Burén 2015), and on the roles played by heritage in general, and religious heritage in particular, in late-modern societies (e.g. Nora 1998, Paine 2013, Sullivan 2015, Wangefelt Ström 2011, Hillström, Löfgren & Wetterberg 2017, Harding 2016b, 2018).

The article focuses on official documents, such as government bills and government reports, published after 1988 in the process leading up the increased separation of church and state in 2000. The significance ascribed to heritage churches in these documents is contextualized in the wider context of a post-Christian secularized society, which is described on the basis of previous research and illustrated with statements made by, among others, then-prime minister Göran Persson, and traced further back in 20th century Swedish history. It is analyzed with a focus on how these churches are understood as post-Christian sacred spaces, suggesting that there is a connection between the way in which secularization has developed in Sweden, and the high priority so far given to its ecclesiastical heritage in the form of Church of Sweden heritage churches. The article is limited by its focus on how the government relates to such heritage churches, even though it also includes examples and descriptions of cultural and ideological movements in Swedish society in order to contextualize these policies. The article opens by discussing the central theoretical concepts used in the analysis: sacred and secular, secularization, and post-Christian, in relation to religious heritage. It then continues with an analysis of the main ways in which churches and ecclesiastical heritage were understood when the separation of church and state was prepared, tracing these ways of understanding it backwards through the history of Swedish heritage and Church policies in the 20th century, and offering some reflections on current developments in the significance of heritage churches in Sweden.

Central Concepts

'Sacred' and 'secular' are closely related terms, often defined as opposites, but often also viewed as defining each other. The notion of sacredness has long been a central concept in understanding the roles played by religion and ritual in societies. For the purposes of this article, the idea of sacred spaces becomes a central aspect of the sacred. In a sacred space, behavior, for those who accept it as sacred, is guided by other norms than those guiding behavior in other places. The sacred space has ritual meaning, often representing the general order of the cosmos, as understood by believers. In his classical work *The Sacred and the Profane*, Mircea Eliade (1961) draws examples of the cultural differentiation between these two spatial categories from a large number of cultures and religious traditions. Among these examples is that of a church in a Western city:

> For a believer, the church shares in a different space from the street in which it stands. The door that opens on the interior of the church actually signifies a solution of continuity. The threshold that separates the two spaces also indicates the distance between two modes of being, the profane and the religious. The threshold is the limit, the boundary, the frontier that distinguishes and opposes two worlds – and at the same time the paradoxical place where those worlds communicate, where passage from the profane to the sacred world becomes possible. (Eliade 1961: 25)

Eliade argues that time is understood differently in sacred spaces, that it is one of the functions of religious ritual to transport the participant out of the everyday experience of time and space, reconnecting her, or him, to mythical time:

> Just as a church constitutes a break in plane in the profane space of a modem city, the service celebrated inside it marks a break in profane temporal duration. It is no longer today's historical time that is present, the time that is experienced, for example, in the adjacent streets, but the time in which the historical existence of Jesus Christ occurred, the time sanctified by his preaching, by his passion, death, and resurrection. (Eliade 1961: 72)

From this perspective, sacred space is not only characterized by ritual behavior, but also constituted by it. In the case of Sweden, churches until year 2000 legally became classified as such – and thus also legally protected as heritage – through the performance of the sacralization ritual prescribed in the liturgy of the Church of Sweden. Conversely, they could also cease to be legally classified as church buildings through a desacralization ritual. After 2000, legal protection of these churches as built heritage concerns church buildings constructed before 1940, and owned by the Church of Sweden in 2000, a status based on their historical building date and legal status, regardless of any religious rituals that may occur today (Government of Sweden 1998: 134f).

Understanding the world less as a sacred cosmos, and more through the framework of a non-religious, or disenchanted, worldview is often viewed as a central aspect of the process of secularization (Weber 1993, Taylor 2007). Other central aspects observed by the Canadian philosopher Charles Taylor are a decline in personal belief in the divine, and the increased separation of the social and institutional spheres of the state and of religious organizations (Taylor 2007). These aspects of secularization do not always coincide, and the process of secularization has taken significantly different paths in various societies, creating different understandings of the meaning of secular society. The Nordic societies of North-Western Europe are today characterized by a very low level of belief in the God of the traditional Evangelical-Lutheran religion, and public discourse is not to any high degree characterized by direct references to religion, but the spheres of church and state have remained close (Casanova 2014), as exemplified by the above mentioned legislation on church buildings.

While belief in God is not particularly high in the Nordic countries, it can be argued that what has truly increased is not atheism in a strict sense, but rather a more vague belief in "something", or even in a "God", but in a more vague sense than when understood from a strict, or traditional, theological perspective. It has also been observed that culture and life in present day Swedish society still retains many characteristics reminding us of its Christian and, specifically, Lutheran past; such as its calendar, public celebrations and holidays, as well as many traditions celebrated publicly, or in private. In this sense, e.g. Christian symbolism and ways of understanding time lives on in how the year is structured, within an otherwise secular understanding of the world (Thurfjell 2015, Burén 2015, cf. Assmann 2011). In order to emphasize such characteristics, such societies can be described as 'post-Christian', i.e. as a society which understands itself as secular, and which contains members from a multitude of religious backgrounds, but which, at the same time, has a number of characteristics in its self-understanding and cultural organization which are the recognizable results of its Christian history (cf. Thurfjell 2015, Burén 2015, Moberg 2013). Similarly, a society could be described as 'post-Lutheran' if these characteristics have their background in a specifically Lutheran spirituality. As illustrated by the case of Sweden, secularization does not necessarily mean that all religious institutions or denominations disappear from public life. There are, in fact, many examples of the contrary, and it has been argued that increased separation of church and state frees religious denominations to act more independently in the public sphere (Casanova 1994, 2014).

In the context of cultural heritage, museums and heritage sites have often been understood as secular spaces, sometimes even as metaphorical 'secular temples' filling a role in the context of secular ideologies and national communities similar to that of holy sites (cf. Duncan 1995, Bennett 1995, Nora 1998). Much like sacred spaces, heritage sites can be understood as enabling people to reach out to a different time than that of the surrounding world, albeit to historical time rather than to the sacred time invoked in religious buildings. The heritagization of sacred objects and spaces can thus be understood as a secularization, changing how the religious building is understood; from sacred space to heritage site (cf. Bennett 1995, Paine 2013, Koselleck 2004, Nora 1998). This process has been compared to the reinterpretation, or removal, of Catholic symbols in Swedish churches during the reformation, as well as to other reinterpretations of religious sites and objects during changes in official religion (Wangefelt Ström 2006, 2011). Common to these processes is that they are all processes of reinterpretation and domestication, where religious objects are reinterpreted within the context of a new dominant worldview; be it a different religious interpretation, or that of secular historicism. Today, there are also many cases of the opposite process to that of religious sites being reinterpreted as heritage, e.g. museums starting to treat religious objects with a greater respect for the religious understanding of them, or even adopting some of the ritual respect which according to religious communities should be paid to certain objects (Paine 2013, Sullivan 2015). As this article will further illustrate, the categories of heritage spaces and sacred spaces are often less separate from each other than was previously assumed.

Churches as Heritage in Sweden

The current heritage protection regime in Sweden can be traced at least back to the statute protecting government-owned heritage buildings introduced in 1920 (SFS 1920:744). This regulation has later been complemented with legislation protecting privately owned buildings. The current heritage law dates from 1988, and combines these areas of heritage protection (SFS 1988:950, Government of Sweden 1987). All church buildings and churchyards belonging to the established church – the Church of Sweden – became automatically protected under the rules for government owned heritage buildings included in the 1920 heritage statute, and continued to be protected under the 1988 Heritage Law, with one major change; only churches built before 1940, and owned by the Church of Sweden, would now enjoy this protection. Newer churches would not. The difference was explained as follows in the government bill proposing the legislation to parliament:

> Considering, among other things, the historical importance of churches as the heart of the parish, and as examples of the architecture of times past, most of our older churches have to be recognized as being of great importance from the standpoint of cultural history. […] When the construction of churches increased again, in the 1950's, the character of the churches had changed in a way that motivates my proposal to abolish the requirement of government permission for the construction of new churches. Most churches constructed after 1939 are also different when compared to churches in a traditional sense (Government of Sweden 1987: 57).

Both around 1920 and in 1988, the suggestion had been made that individual churches should be judged on their importance as cultural heritage, but on both occasions the government chose automatic protection without selection, since it was assumed that the vast majority of churches would be judged important enough to protect (Government of Sweden 1987, cf. Ministry of Ecclesiastic Affairs 1922, Wetterberg 1992, 2011, Hillström 2017). The central reasons for the continued protection of ecclesiastical heritage given in 1988 were all mentioned in the government bill quoted above; churches were preserved for their significance to local identity, and for their value as historical documentation. These aspects were also viewed as highly related (cf. Harding 2018). In the fundamental goals of Swedish cultural policy laid down in the cultural policy bill of 1974, the government had argued that the presence in landscapes and cityscapes of tangible evidence of the history of the place was necessary for the well-being of the people who lived there:

> When the individual […] is deprived of his connection backwards in time, his feelings of insecurity and alienation grows. The preservation of historical continuity in the physical cultural environment is thus of fundamental importance to the individual's feeling of security and anchoring in existence. (Government of Sweden 1974: 301)

The local church as a symbol of historical continuity, on both the local and the national levels, was already a long established concept in Sweden. Several heritage policy documents had already used this argument (e.g. Ministry of Ecclesiastical Affairs 1922, Ministry of Education 1972), and more would use it later (e.g. Government of Sweden 1987, Government of Sweden 1995, Ministry of Culture 1995, Government of Sweden 1996, cf. Harding 2018). It can be traced at least back to the turn of the century (Harding 2016b).

While local identity had already been linked to the parish churches in the early 20th century, this connection at that time also included the relation between national and religious identity. The role of the Church, as well as of physical churches and of other heritage buildings, had been central to the nationalist movements of the late 19^{th} century and early 20^{th} century. This was especially true of the Young Church Movement (Sw: "ungkyrkorörelsen"), which can, in this context, be understood as the explicitly Christian side of a larger nationalist trend in Swedish society, and thus more concerned with churches than nationalism in general. The Young Church Movement emphasized the role of the Church of Sweden as the institutionalization of the Christian faith in Sweden, and the imagined community of the Church as close to identical to that of the Swedish nation, aiming to revitalize this side of national identity, thus leading the nation back to its Christian roots. This connection between the Church as a community of faith, and the nation as an ethno-cultural community, has almost never been referred to in official discourse on churches as heritage since the mid-20th century, but it played a significant role in such discourses in the early 20th century. This connection was also intrinsically linked to the previously mentioned focus on local identity; local parish churches had been viewed as symbols of the idealized local rural communities that were now imagined as the site of an idealized authentically Swedish culture that had preceded the present urbanization and industrialization. To the Young Church Movement, this image had been one of an organic community of Christianity and Swedish culture (Blückert 2000, Sundeen 2008, Harding 2016b, Tergel 1974). These views can be illustrated by the following lines from the hymn "Church of the Fathers" (Sw: "Fädernas Kyrka"), which was a central symbol in the Young Church Movement.

> Firmly she is founded by the hand of the Lord,
> Built to be his temple in the North.
> All was consecrated in the embrace of the Church:
> The bridegroom's vow to his bride,
> The home, the newborn's Christian name,
> The warriors' voyage to the last haven,
> The banner and the garb of the King.
> (*Den svenska psalmboken* 1937: 154f)

This passage emphasizes the metaphorical and physical church as the sacred space where important events in the life of the individual, as well as in that of the nation, are ritually marked and sanctified (Eckerdal 1988, Blückert 2000, Harding 2016b). The church is made to simultaneously represent both, the mytho-historical time of church ritual and the Bible, and the Christian history of Sweden, merging the two into an organic unity.

In later heritage policies, understanding Swedish history as one of a culturally and religiously homogeneous agrarian society has become a dominant way of narrating Swedish history, but it has often been combined with a narrative of secularization, in which this historical society is contrasted with the post-World War II modern and secular welfare state, thus establishing modern Swedish secular identity as the successor to a homogeneously religious one (cf. Harding 2007, Hyltén-Cavallius & Svanberg 2016). This narrative can also help us understand the change in heritage legislation from general automatic protection of church buildings to protecting only the pre-War churches. While the pre-War churches could symbolize pre-modern Sweden, the newer churches were seen as parts of the present, otherwise secular, modern welfare state. As such, they carried no more significance than other buildings, and there was thus no reason for them to be protected under other criteria than those for heritage status for other buildings (cf. Government of Sweden 1987:57, quoted earlier in this article, Harding 2018). After the separation of church and state in 2000, the separation between the secular current age and the religious heritage of pre-industrial society has become institutionalized as the separation between the religious neutrality of the state, and its role in preserving the religious heritage of the past. As expressed by the latest Government Bill on Cultural Heritage:

> In the tangent of a clearer separation between the state and the Protestant church, lies an important symbolic and cultural change in the view of what belongs to society as a whole. The ecclesiastical cultural heritage has evolved during nearly a millennium, and through the position of the Church in society, the ecclesiastical cultural heritage has become a significant part of the history of the country. This situation remains regardless of the organizational state of affairs that this heritage, due to the change of relations, has now, to a large extent, come to be administered within the private sector. (Government of Sweden 17: 41f)

The Church, the Nation, and the (Social) Democratic State

While the old identification of church and nation has now been relegated to being a relation to the Lutheran history of the nation, views of the Church of Sweden as ideally open to the entire people of Sweden has remained relevant in the self-understanding of the Church in the form of the concept of the Church as a *Folk* Church, or "people's church", i.e. as an institution ideally open to the entire people of the nation. As such, the *Folk* Church could be said to build on ideas once common in the Young Church Movement, and in that context related to its largely ethno-cultural understanding of the national community (Blückert 2000). During the 20th century, the concept has, however, developed to become more closely related to civic concepts of nationality, including a view of democratic participation in the government of the Church which is largely parallel to notions of democratic participation in Swedish national democracy. The *Folk* Church could thus be viewed as a parallel to the 20th century vision of the welfare state as a *folkhem*, a "people's home" where the state would care for the welfare of the people (Claesson 2004, Blückert 2000, Harding 2016b). Just like the *folkhem*, the *Folk* Church could be said to have moved from an ethno-cultural understanding of the nation and its people, towards a more civic one where the people is understood as a collective of citizens (or church members, in the case of the *Folk* Church), but still retaining some of its original ethno-cultural, and patriarchal, characteristics (cf. Lagergren 1999, Berggren & Trägårdh 2015).

In the 1990s, when the separation of church and state was being prepared, it appears that the democratically elected leadership of the church, its clerical leadership, and a majority of the national parliament already agreed that a separation of church and state was desirable. Yet there were also dissenting voices. The last leading politician to oppose the separation of church and state was probably Göran Persson, who was, ironically, the Prime Minister under whose leadership the separation would be enacted, after the decision had been made in the months before his election to leader of the Social Democrats, and his appointment to Prime Minister in 1996 (Ekström 2003). When he later discussed the issue in his autobiography – as the first political issue he mentions there – his argument focused not on Christianity, but on the church as a place, and as an institution, to which each citizen can turn when his, or her, needs are spiritual, rather than material; a spiritual counterpart to the material welfare offered by the state, but also an institution manifesting the national community, much as it had been at the beginning of the 20th century:

> The Church is our Swedish *Folk* Church, in the best possible meaning of that word. All of us should have a right to gather there. When life sometimes chooses a direction with consequences that we might not be able to carry on our own, all of us should be welcome to the Church. Such things happen to everyone, many times in a lifetime […].
>
> In my view, the separation of the Church of Sweden and the state started a movement away from the public and towards the private. […] This development might have come anyway, but it has definitely been expedited by the separation of the Church from the state. As to the costs for cultural heritage, i.e. campaniles and church buildings, the state – i.e. all Swedish taxpayers – is likely to end up paying anyway. (Persson 2008: 20f)

Even to Persson himself, this feeling of community now appeared to have become a part of the past, but as a part of the nation's cultural heritage it remained a government responsibility. His memoirs also give as an example of a view of what the church, and its immediate surroundings, can mean to modern Swedes, as a sacred place and a refuge of tranquility, in the context of late-modern Swedish society:

> After the election [of 1998], I took my refuge in the Northern Cemetery in Stockholm. There, I appeared able to find peace and tranquility in the incredibly tense situation in which I found myself. This appears to

> have been the Monday after the election, possibly the Tuesday. I felt like the cemetery offered fresh air and inspiration, which should tell you something about my state of mind. [...]
>
> Cemeteries are often beautiful. Their tranquility speaks to me. The Northern Cemetery in Stockholm possesses both, beauty and peace, it is a gigantic area with many interesting tombstones. I found myself walking around aimlessly, hunting for a specific gravestone. I was looking for the name 'Per Albin Hansson', the Social Democratic prime minister who had coined the concept of the *Folkhem.* (Persson 2008: 197)

In this passage, Persson treats the cemetery in a way resembling what Eliade (1961) describes as a 'sacred space', a space separate from the profane world surrounding it. It becomes a space for thought and contemplation, where he can reflect on a future course of action. At the same time, the emphasis is not on the church as a house of God, but on the cemetery as a physical manifestation of historical memory, where he can seek inspiration not from God, but from his political predecessors. In a similar fashion, Persson discusses the Church as an institution where the people, individually and collectively, can seek solace at times of individual or national tragedy or crisis, such as after the shipwreck of MS Estonia in 1994, or the discotheque fire which killed or injured 263 people in Gothenburg in 1998 (Persson 2008). This understanding appears to be deeply rooted in a society where the 'standard' schema for understanding the sacred remains based in a Christian tradition, even though this tradition is present in daily life only in the form of seemingly secular traditions, such as holiday celebrations, or ceremonies connected to major life events (cf. Thurfjell 2015, Burén 2015). This could be seen as a parallel to what Michael Billig (1995) refers to as 'banal nationalism', i.e. everyday reminders of national belonging, e.g. in the forms of national sports teams of national weather maps, which still serves to reinforce the national identity for each individual, so that this identity can be re-actualized in times of crisis.

Interestingly, viewing churches and cemeteries as generalized post-Christian sacred spaces, decoupled from their denominational context and viewed as heritage, at least as much as they are understood specifically in the context of Christianity, is an understanding with many historical parallels, to the Romantic movement of the 19th century, as well as to the attempts of early Social Democrats to relate their vision to earlier concepts of religion and the nation. Person's understanding of churches has parallels in statements made by earlier Social Democratic politicians in Sweden. It has, for example, much in common with the following thoughts presented by Arthur Engberg, who was the Minister of Ecclesiastical Affairs in the first stable Social Democratic governments of the 1930's. These remarks were part of a radio speech he made in 1942, and framed as a reflection on the poem "The Image of the Madonna in Heda" (Sv. "Himladrottningens bild i Heda") by the Swedish national-romantic poet Verner von Heidenstam (1915):

> The world of tradition is the world of devotion. There, we approach the personalities of the past. There, whispers voices from the graves. There, live story and memory. Family, neighborhood and people meet us. [...] We become a link in a development which has started before us and which will continue after us. [...] There, they made their deeds, their joys and their sorrows, fought and suffered. [...]
>
> The bridge between us and the powers of life, between us and what we hold sacred, is thus not knowledge. It is not a work of thought or science. It is life, faith, piety, and devotion. (Engberg 1945:292f)

Engberg takes the poem, in which a young poet converses with a Medieval image of the Madonna, as the starting point for a reflection on tradition and spirituality. Much like Persson, Engberg viewed the church and its heritage as a context via which it is possible to gain a personal relation to the past, to the struggles of past generations, and by which it becomes possible to understand the present, including issues of identity and politics. He also does so in a context where he views the struggles of humanity both, as an object of reverence and as an expression of spirituality, which can be accessed through heritage, and perhaps especially by heritage with a specifically religious, or spiritual, subject. As such, churches and cemeteries may be viewed not only as Christian, or specifically Lutheran, sacred spaces, but also as post-Christian, post-Lutheran, sacred spaces for devotion in a generalized spirituality, where the sacred place connects the visitor not so much to the time of the historical Christ, but to the flow of history in general, and in particular to the early times of the particular church building.

Quite appropriately, the line from von Heidenstam's poem which Engberg took as the title for his radio speech was "*Den har tro för vilken mycket är heligt*", i.e. "He has faith for whom much is sacred". Engberg had started as an anti-clerical and outspokenly atheist socialist politician and writer, but with time turned into one of the builders of the Social Democratic welfare state in general, and of its politics on education, culture, and the Church, in particular. While he continued to argue for retaining government control over the Church of Sweden, he also appears to have come to embrace a generalized romantic spirituality (cf. Harding 2015, Harding 2016b). During World War II, he apparently found the combination of von Heidenstam – then still viewed as something of a national poet (cf. Nyblom 2008) – and ecclesiastical heritage to be an appropriate symbol for a contemplative speech to the public on how all our works build upon those of our forefathers, and on how true spirituality is found not in dogma, but in the contemplation of art, nature, and heritage. Sixty-five years later, Persson would not have been likely to refer to von Heidenstam in this way, but as we have seen, he otherwise professed to be drawn in a similar way to ecclesiastical heritage, using it and its connection to previous leaders of his party and the nation, as a starting point for planning the future of the country. At least, this is how he chose to present the scene in his memoirs, symbolically indicating the profoundness of the situation.

Ecclesiastical heritage, religion, and post-Christianity

Since 2000, the Church of Sweden is legally a part of the Third Sector, rather than a state church, and the state aims to stay neutral and uninvolved in relation to the religious activities if the Church, as well as to treat all religious denominations equally, if not identically (Harding 2016a). At the same time, the ecclesiastical heritage of the Church of Sweden remains protected in law, and described in government bills and reports as something that it is a government priority to preserve and maintain accessible for the entire population. The *Folk* Church ideal of openness can thus be said to have been transferred from the religious mission of the Church to its ecclesiastical heritage, at least in the eyes of the state. Documents, such as the government bill proposing to separate church and state, define this heritage in a relatively open manner:

> This is a living cultural heritage, which for many centuries has been continuously used, and is still used, for the same purpose. It is also a cultural heritage which is accessible for everyone, regardless of, for example, religious affiliation, age, sex, and citizenship. Everyone is able to experience the church buildings and their interiors as historical and antiquarian monuments, take part of art and architecture, listen to church music, or seek a moment of peace and tranquility. […] It is of great importance that this common cultural heritage is preserved for future generations. (Government of Sweden 1998: 134)

As we can see in this quote, the concept of cultural heritage has been extended to include a number of other values than that of documenting history, or even that of reinforcing identity (Harding 2018). This extension has some basis in the general development of heritage policy in Sweden, as well as in international developments in the heritage and museum sector. In the 1950's, Swedish heritage policy had already started to extend its protection from individual buildings to entire milieus (Ministry of Justice 1956). In the latest government bill on heritage protection, the government proposes to specifically include vegetation in the protected heritage of churchyards and cemeteries (Government of Sweden 2017). The bill on the state and the Church of Sweden, quoted above, appears to include not only activities such as religious music in the protected heritage, somewhat in the style of UNESCO's views on protection for intangible heritage (cf. UNESCO 2003, e.g. Smith & Akagawa 2009), but also the continued use of church buildings for religious purposes.

More than anything, the quote appears to focus more on the visitor's experience of the building than on its documentary value. This experience is described as including not only the historical aspects of ecclesiastical heritage, but also aesthetic aspects, as well as experiences of 'peace and tranquility', i.e. an almost – or actually – spiritual aspect of the experience of entering a church. It is easy to get the impression that the government bill describes experiences like those Eliade (1961) associated with entering a sacred space, and similar to those associated with ancient churches by Engberg and Persson. Yet, what is being described here are activities for which churches, with the financial support of the state, should continue to be accessible to all, regardless of religious affiliation, even after the change of relations between church and state, and considered to be in line with an interpretation of the freedom religion which was considered to preclude the existence of an established church (Government of Sweden 1998, Harding 2016a). This apparent paradox could be understood in the context of post-Christian Sweden, and its understanding of the concepts of 'religion' and 'Christianity'. According to religious studies researcher David Thurfjell (2015), the term 'Christianity' is now generally perceived as referring only to a strict understanding of the religion; someone who believes in all of the ethical and theological claims ascribed to it. Many people in Sweden do not identify as 'Christian', even though they appear to hold more diffusely religious, or spiritual, beliefs (Thurfjell 2015, Burén 2015).

According to a survey made in 2012, around 45 percent of the Swedish population answer that they believe in God, a figure that appears to be relatively stable (Bromander 2013). In 2005, 53 percent believed in "a kind of spirit or life force" (Thurfjell 2015: 25). Considering that in 2012, 67.5 percent of the population were members of Church of Sweden (Svenska kyrkan 2019), it has to be assumed that many of those holding more generally spiritual beliefs also remain members of the Church of Sweden. Surveys made by the Church of Sweden reach results that point in the same direction. In 2015, 67 percent of the respondents of a member survey stated that they are members of the Church in order to be able to celebrate church ceremonies, such as baptisms, confirmations, weddings, and funerals, i.e. to celebrate ceremonies marking important life events in the context of the liturgy, and in church buildings. In the same survey, 53 percent stated that they had attended such ceremonies during the past year, while 60 percent had visited cemeteries. This could be compared to the 26 percent who had attended a regular church service during the past year. In the same survey, 47 percent stated that they were members so that the churches themselves could be preserved, and 44 percent that they consider their membership a part of their Swedish identity. Only 28 percent were members because they viewed themselves as Christian, although 45 percent stated that it was so that Sweden would continue to be a Christian country (statistics from Church of Sweden).

Even though many people in Sweden do not view themselves as Christians, or even as religious, their understanding of the spiritual appears to be shaped by a history where Christianity, in the form of the Lutheranism of the established church, has been the normative understanding of religious practice and belief, and where religious life has been shaped around that church (Thurfjell 2015, Burén 2015). The connection between church membership and national, as well as local, identity remains strong. In 1998, policy makers appear to still have associated churches not only with experiences of history and aesthetic values, or with the specific creed of the Church of Sweden, but also with feelings of 'peace and tranquility', a place representing spirituality and historical continuity, sheltered from the turmoil of the world. This 'sacred space' (cf. Eliade 1961) should not become the property of one single religious denomination. While churches in 2000 did literally became the property of Church of Sweden parishes (Harding 2016a), the state took it upon itself to continue to guarantee that heritage churches, including all churches built before 1940, were preserved and remained accessible for the public.

Concluding Reflections

It has often been claimed that we see a process where religious objects and sites are heritagized, and through this process secularized: religious objects and buildings become seen as historical monuments and museum pieces, rather than as sacred objects and places. Yet, it has also often been observed that there are similarities between the norm-prescribed approach of museum and heritage audiences to the displayed objects, and the prescribed venerating attitude expected of a religious worshiper approaching a sacred object or place. It is not only the case that churches are becoming increasingly museum-like, it is also that museums have always had similarities with sacred places.

Based on the examples in this article, I suggest that the ongoing heritagization of Church of Sweden's church buildings could also be seen as a process where they are decontextualized from the denominationally specific religiosity of the Church of Sweden, but rather than being re-contextualized only as secular heritage, they could be more clearly understood as becoming the sacred places and sacred objects of a post-Lutheran civil religion and generalized religiosity, i.e. not simply as a disenchantment, but also as a re-enchantment. People come to churches to contemplate heritage, spirituality, and aesthetics, as well as to celebrate life events, often without making a difference between secular and religious categories. This approach could be understood as a continuation of traditions of approaching memory and the sacred, developed in a society characterized by the near hegemony of the established church in the religious sphere, but also in partially counter-clerical movements, such as the Romantic movement (including, e.g. von Heidenstam). It is not only an example of heritage and religion coexisting in the same spaces, but of the close relationship and strong similarities between these two categories. While many visitors to Swedish churches may seek to experience both spirituality and history, the separation of church and state requires both state and Church to separate religion and heritage, even when both the state and the Church appears to want to take responsibility for aspects which could be described as spiritual.

How things will develop in an increasingly multi-religious society, where only a shrinking part of the population can be expected to identify with the formerly established church, or that church with the nation, remains to be seen. The part of the population who regularly participates in church services has remained relatively constant throughout the 20th century (cf. Thurfjell 2015: 23, Bromander 2013), but membership in the Church of Sweden continues to shrink. Today, non-Lutheran figures, such as the Dalai Lama, appear to be at least as adapted to function as symbols of generalized post-Lutheran spirituality as representatives of the Church of Sweden (cf. Thurfjell 2015). While only a small portion of the Swedish people view themselves as Lutherans, or even as Christians, many more remain members of the Church of Sweden, often specifically in order to have access to church buildings and the ceremonies performed there. Representatives of all political parties continue to support ecclesiastical heritage in the form of Church of Sweden heritage churches as a major part of Swedish protected heritage, to which all should have equal access. It would appear that Sweden, both as a society and as a state, remains post-Lutheran, at least in its understanding of the churches that are preserved as the heritage of the established church that has dominated Swedish understanding of spirituality since the Middle Ages (first as a part of the Catholic Church, and later as a Lutheran national church). In other policy areas than heritage policy, the Swedish state has made attempts to offer equal opportunity to other religious denominations (Harding 2013). Comparing the corresponding efforts made to include the heritage of other religions in government-protected heritage of Sweden to the understandings of ecclesiastical heritage discussed in this article, will have to be the subject of a different article. The analysis presented here suggests that such a comparative study could have much to say about how religion and identity are understood and presented in Sweden today.

By understanding the relationship between heritage and sacrality better, scholars could better understand the roles played by religious heritage, as well as of heritage in general, in post-Christian, or otherwise secularized, societies. It would appear that heritage sites can function in ways similar to those of religiously sacred spaces, in that they are approached as spaces separate from the surrounding contemporary mundane world. In the case of Swedish heritage churches, this appears to be the case regardless of whether the separate time of these spaces is understood as relating to the history of the particular church building, or to the mytho-historical sacred time of the Christian revelation, or simultaneously to both , understanding local history in the context of Christian history, or Christian history in the context of the history of the local or national community. It is also worth noting that several of the policy documents quoted in this article view it as especially important that religious activities have continued in these churches continuously throughout their history (Government of Sweden 1998: 134). While church buildings are no longer legally constituted as such through the performance of specific liturgies, there is still a liturgical performative aspect of the heritage value in that the continued performance of religious activities is considered to contribute to it.

This article has approached these issues from the vantage point of a post-Lutheran state where state and church have been closely connected for a long period of time, and where official recognition of religious pluralism has come relatively late. It is likely that the similarities will be larger in countries with a similar history, such as other Nordic countries, Estonia, or the Protestant parts of Germany. There may also be parallels to the developments described in this article in other countries where secular modernity has become central to identity, and is often understood in contrast to a historical condition which is understood as religiously homogeneous, but where the ties between the state and religious institutions remain. In countries where the secular state has a history of conflict with religious institutions, such as France or Turkey, identification may have developed differently, as would likely be the case in the religious landscape of the United States. Yet, post-Christian religiosity and civil religion has now emerged, at least to some degree, in most countries traditionally dominated by Christianity, and religious heritage continues to play a significant role, both in nationally protected cultural heritage and in national identity all over the world.

Tobias Harding is the professor of cultural policy and cultural organization at University of South-Eastern Norway. He is the author of a number of articles, chapters, and books on cultural policy and heritage policy. He is particularly interested in the institutionalization of values and notions of identity in such policies. E-mail: tobias.harding@usn.no

Acknowledgments
The research presented in this paper has been made possible thanks to funding from the Swedish Research Council (Vetenskapsrådet) for the research project 'How the Church of Sweden was Transformed into a National Cultural Heritage' (dnr 2013-1908). My thanks to my colleagues in that project, in the RHiT research network, and the anonymous reviewers assigned by this journal. My thanks to Veronika Possek, for editing this article, and to Pernilla Jonsson at the Central Office of the Church of Sweden, who helped with statistical information.

Notes

[1]All quotes from Swedish sources have been translated by the author of this article.
[2]According to a major survey conducted in 2012, 19 percent of the Swedish population "prayed to God" at least once a month, 8 percent participated in Church services, 45 percent said that they believed in "God", but 78 percent were members of religious organizations (Bromander 2013). The same year 67.5 percent were members of Church of Sweden (Svenska kyrkan 2019).
[3]Swedish laws and statutes are referenced with their number in the official SFS series, including year of publication and number
[4]For a more in depth discussion of Sweden as a Folkhem (people's home) and the Church of Sweden as a Folk Church (people's church), see e.g. Claesson 2004, Blückert 2000, and Harding 2016b. Blückert discusses this with a focus on the ethno-national aspects of the 'folk' of the Folk Church. See also Lagergren 1999, for a discussion of similar aspects of the 'folk' of the Folkhem state. Claesson (2004) analyses the influence of Harald Hallén, a theologian, Church of Sweden cleric, and Social Democrat politician, on the development of the concept of the Folk Church in a less ethno-national and more civic direction. The relationship between conceptions of the Church, heritage, and the nation in Sweden in the Interbellum years is also something that I discussed somewhat more in depth in an article in 2016 (Harding 2016b).
[5]In the election of 1998, the governing Social Democrats lost a significant number of seats in parliament, forcing them to make new alliances in order to stay in power (which they did, with the support of the Left Party, and the Green Party).
[6]For a discussion of Engberg's influence on Swedish cultural policy, see Harding 2015.
[7]If translated focusing on the literal meaning, rather than on poetic aspects, the more relevant lines of von Heidenstam's poem reads as follows:
"Eight hundred Christmas nights,
I saw light their candles.
Child, hear what I tell,
kings kissed my feet.
Forgotten I sit, coated in dust.

Do not pray for what you love,
not for gold, nor for name.
Go, denier!
Only for those who have faith, miracles happen.
[...] I prayed
Give me the golden heart
give a drop of the good,
loving humility,
which, forgotten and without name,
carved and crowned thee,
tall and stern on the queenly throne.
Let me revere and sing to
the great, bright world […]
He has faith for whom much is sacred."
(translated from Heidenstam 1915).

[8]Respondents could choose more than one alternative from a list of 15 alternatives. Other listed alternatives included "take part in other activities offered by the Church of Sweden", "other people need the Church of Sweden", "my life should have a spiritual dimension", "continuing a family tradition", "supporting the international aid work of the Church of Sweden", "the Church of Sweden is an important voice in public debate", "I have not yet gotten around to leave", "I have good experiences with the Church of Sweden", "I have not thought that much about my membership" (statistics from Church of Sweden).

References

Assmann, Aleida (2011): *Cultural Memory and Western Civilization: Functions, Media, Archives.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Bennett, Tony (1995): *The birth of the museum: History, theory, politics.* London: Routledge.

Berggren, Henrik & Trägårdh, Lars (2015): *Är svensken människa? Gemenskap och oberoende i det moderna Sverige*. 2nd ed. Stockholm: Norstedts.

Billig, Michael (1995): *Banal Nationalism*. London: Sage.

Blückert, Kjell (2000): *The Church as Nation: A Study in Ecclesiology and Nationhood*. Frankfurt: Peter Lang.

Bromander, Jonas (2013): "Religiositet i Sverige",Lenart Weibull, Henrik Oscarsson & Annika Bergström (eds.) *Vägskäl*. Göteborg: Göteborgs universitet, SOM-institutet, 291-301.

Burén, Ann af (2015): *Living Simultaneity: On religion among semi-secular Swedes*. Huddinge. Södertörns Högskola.

Casanova, José (1994): *Public religions in the modern world*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.

Casanova, José (2014): "Two dimensions, temporal and spatial, of the secular: comparative reflections on the Northern Protestant and Southern Catholic perspectives from a global perspective", Rosemarie van den Breemer, José Casanova & Trygve Wyller (eds.) *Secular and sacred? The Scandinavian case of religion in human rights, law and public space*, Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 21-33.

Claesson, Urban (2004): *Folkhemmets kyrka. Harald Hallén och folkkyrkans genombrott, En studie av socialdemokrati, kyrka och nationsbygge med särskild hänsyn till perioden 1905–1933*. Uppsala: Acta Universitatis Upsaliensis.

Den svenska psalmboken (1937): Uppsala: Svenska kyrkan.

Duncan, Carol (1995): *Civilizing Rituals: Inside Public Art Museums*. London: Routledge.

Eckerdal, Jan (1988): "'Fädernas kyrka' och Guds: Kyrkosyner i Svenska kyrkans psalmböcker", *Svensk teologisk kvartalsskrift*, 1988:64, 112-129.

Ekström, Sören (2003): *Makten över kyrkan, om Svenska kyrkan, folket och staten*. Stockholm: Verbum.

Eliade, Mircea (1961): *The Sacred and the Profane. The Nature of Religion*. New York: Harcourt, Brace & World.

Engberg, Arthur (1945): ”Den har tro för vilken mycket är heligt", Arthur Engberg. *Tal och skrifter III*. Stockholm: Tiden, 287-294.

Government of Sweden (1974): *Proposition 1974:28. Om kulturpolitik.* Stockholm: Riksdagen.

Government of Sweden (1988): *Proposition 1987/88:104. Om kulturmiljövård.* Stockholm: Riksdagen.

Government of Sweden (1995): *Proposition 1995/96:80. Ändrade relationer mellan staten och Svenska kyrkan*. Stockholm: Riksdagen.

Government of Sweden (1996): *Proposition 1996/97:3. Kulturpolitik*. Stockholm: Riksdagen.

Government of Sweden (1998): *Proposition* 1998/99:38. *Staten och trossamfunden: begravningsverksamheten, kulturminnena, personalen, avgiftsbetalningen, m.m*. Stockholm: Riksdagen.

Government of Sweden (2017): 2016/17:116. *Kulturarvspolitik*. Stockholm: Riksdagen.

Harding, Tobias (2007): *Nationalising Culture: The Reorganization of Swedish Cultural Policy 1970-2002.* Linköping: Linköping University.

Harding, Tobias (2013): "Faith-Based Organizations and the Secular State: The Establishment of a Muslim Study Association in Sweden", *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs*, 33:3, 341-355.

Harding, Tobias (2015): "*Bildning* as a Central Concept in the Cultural Policy of the Swedish Government – From Arthur Engberg to Alice Bah Kuhnke" in *Nordic Journal of Cultural Policy*, 2015:2.

Harding, Tobias (2016a): "From State Church to Third Sector Organization? The Separation of Church and State in Sweden", *International Society for Third-Sector Research Working Paper Series X,* Baltimore, MD: ISTR.

Harding, Tobias (2016b): "The Dawn of the Secular State: Heritage and Identity in Swedish Church and State Debates 1920–1939". *International Journal of Cultural Policy*. 22:4, 631-647.

Harding, Tobias (2018): "Preserving Churches for Future Generations: Central Values in Swedish Policies on Church Heritage", *Nordic Journal of Cultural Policy,*1:21, 5–24.

Heidenstam, Verner von (1915): *Nya dikter*. Stockholm: Bonniers.

Hillström, Magdalena (1917): ”Staten, kyrkan och ansvaret för kyrkobyggnaderna", Magdalena Hillström, Eva Löfgren & Ola Wetterberg (eds.) *Alla dessa kyrkor: Kulturvård, religion och politik.* Göteborg: Göteborgs universitet.

Hillström, Magdalena, Löfgren, Eva & Wetterberg, Ola (eds.) (2017): *Alla dessa kyrkor: Kulturvård, religion och politik.* Göteborg: Göteborgs universitet.

Hyltén-Cavallius, Charlotte & Svanberg, Fredrik (2016): *Älskade museum: Svenska kulturhistoriska museer som kulturproducenter och samhällsbyggare*. Stockholm: Nordic Academic Press.

Josephson-Storm, Jason A. (2017): *The Myth of Disenchantment: Magic, Modernity, and the Birth of the Human Sciences.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Koselleck, Reinhart (2004): *Futures Past: On the Semantics of Historical Time.* New York: Colombia University Press.

Lagergren, Fredrika (1999): *På andra sidan välfärdsstaten, En studie i politiska idéers betydelse*, Eslöv: Brutus Östlings bokförlag, Symposion.

Ministry of Culture (1995): *Kulturpolitikens inriktning*. SOU 1995:84. Stockholm: Fritzes.

Ministry of Ecclesiastic Affairs (1922): *Betänkande med förslag till lag angående kulturminnesvård samt organisation av kulturminnesvården.* SOU 1922:11–12. Stockholm: Centraltryckeriet

Ministry of Education (1972): *Samhälle och trossamfund*. SOU 1972:36. Stockholm: Beckmans tryckerier.

Ministry of Justice (1956): *Byggnadsminnen*. SOU 1956:26. Stockholm: Victor Pettersons bokindustri.

Ministry of Public Administration (1994): *Staten och trossamfunden*. SOU 1994:42. Stockholm: Fritzes.

Moberg, Jessica (2013): *Piety, Intimacy and Mobility: A Case Study of Charismatic Christianity in Present Day Stockholm.* Huddinge: Södertörns Högskola.

Nora, Pierre (1998): "The Era of Commemoration", Pierre Nora (ed.) *The Construction of the French Past: Realms of Memory. Volyme III: Symbols*. New York: Colombia University Press, 609–637.

Nyblom, Andreas (2008): *Ryktbarhetens ansikte: Verner von Heidenstam, medierna och personkulten i sekelskiftet Sverige*. Stockholm: Atlantis.

Paine, Crispin (2013): *Religious Objects in Museums: Private Lives and Public Duties*. London: Bloomsbury.

Persson, Göran (2008): *Min väg, mina val*. Stockholm: Bonniers.

SFS (Svensk författningssamling) 1920:744. Kunglig Maj:ts kungörelse med föreskrifter om det offentliga byggnadsväsendet. Stockholm: Riksdagen.

SFS (Svensk författningssamling) 1988:950. Kulturmiljölag. Stockholm: Riksdagen.

Smith, Laurajane & Akagawa, Natsuko (2009): *Intangible Heritage*. New York: Routledge.

Sullivan, Bruce M. (ed.) (2015): *Sacred Objects in Secular Spaces: Exhibiting Asian Religions in Museums*. London: Bloomsbury.

Sundback, Susan (2007): "Membership in Nordic 'National' Churches as a 'Civil Religious' Phenomenon", *Implicit Religion,* 10:3, 262-280.

Sundeen, Johan (2008): *Andelivets agitator: J.A. Eklund, kristendomen och kulturen.* Lund: Minerva och Högskolan i Borås.

Svenska kyrkan (2019): "Svenska kyrkans medlemsutveckling år 1972–2017", document downloaded from the Church of Sweden website, www.svenskakyrkan.se (accessed 02/05/19).

Taylor, Charles (2007): A *Secular Age*. Harvard: Harvard University Press.

Tergel, Alf (1974): *Från konfrontation till institution. Ungkyrkorörelsen 1912–1917.* Stockholm: Verbum.

Thurfjäll, David (2015): *Det gudlösa folket. De postkristna svenskarna och religionen*. Stockholm: Molin & Sorgenfrei.

UNESCO (2003): *Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage.*

Wangefelt Ström, Helena (2006): ”Kulturarv: Ikon för en sekulariserad tid”, *Kulturella perspektiv – Svensk etnologisk tidskrift*, 15:3, 67-76.

Wangefelt Ström, Helena (2011): ”Heligt, hotfullt, historiskt: Kulturarvifieringen av det katolska i 1600-talets Sverige”, *Lychnos*, 2011:29-53.

Weber, Max (1993): *The Sociology of Religion.* Boston: Beacon Press

Wetterberg, Ola (1992): *Monument och miljö: Perspektiv på det tidiga 1900-talets byggnadsvård i Sverige*. Göteborg: CTH.

Wetterberg, Ola (2011): “Conservation and the Professions: The Swedish Context 1880-1920”, Melanie Hall (ed.) *Towards World Heritage: International Origins of the Preservation Movement 1870-1930*. Surrey: Ashgate, 201–220.

Culture Unbound
Journal of Current Cultural Research

Volunteering as Media Work: The Case of the Eurovision Song Contest

By Fredrik Stiernstedt & Irina Golovko

Abstract

This article explores volunteering in relation to the Eurovision Song Contest (ESC), which took place in Stockholm in 2016 and in Kyiv in 2017, with the aim of shedding light on volunteering as a form of "media work". Following from this, the article aims to problematize the theoretical concept of free labour and analyse the symbolic exchanges and currencies involved in employing a "free" labour force. Through interviews with volunteers, this article explores what volunteers at huge media events do, how their work is organized, and what motivates them. The empirical basis for this article is an interview study with volunteers and volunteer organizers of the ESC in Stockholm (May 2016) and in Kyiv (May 2017), complemented with a document analysis of volunteer guidebooks and organizational reports. The article shows that eventfulness is an essential part of what volunteer labour brings to an event such as the ESC. It is also a key element in the production of economic value: eventfulness is a currency that expresses the value of the event itself and is a key feature of place branding. Furthermore, eventfulness – along with the feeling of being a part of an event, of something bigger, as it unfolds in time – is a key feature of the motivation for the volunteers who contribute with unpaid labour. As such, eventfulness can also be understood as a form of currency or symbolic capital that forms the main remuneration or "wage" earned by volunteers at an event such as the ESC.

Keywords: media work; volunteering; free labour; Eurovision Song Contest

Stiernstedt, Fredrik & Irina Golovko: "Volunteering as Media Work: The Case of the Eurovision Song Contest", *Culture Unbound*, Volume 11, issue 2, 2019: 231–251. Published by Linköping University Electronic Press: http://www.cultureunbound.ep.liu.se

Introduction

Media and cultural events such as the Eurovision Song Contest (ESC) rely on volunteer work to a high degree. In this, they are like other mega-events, such as the World Cup in football or the Olympics. This article explores volunteering during the ESC in Stockholm 2016 and in Kyiv 2017, and sheds light on volunteering as a form of "media work" (Deuze 2007). Volunteering can be a form of unpaid labour, when performed with or in relation to commercial interests; with this concept as a basis, the purpose of this article is to problematize the concept of free labour and highlight the symbolic exchanges and currencies involved in this form of media work. The article hence asks: what symbolic currencies are involved in free labour at the ESC, how are such symbolic renumerations produced and transferred, and what role do they play for the people involved in free labour? Through interviews with volunteers, this article explores what volunteers at large media events do, how their work is organized, how the volunteers themselves understand their role, what motivates them, and how the organizers of the event work to maintain motivation among volunteers.

Free and unpaid labour is nothing new in the media industries; in fact, it is an intrinsic part of how the media industries are organized, in both traditional media (television, print, film) and new media industries (social network media, wikis) (Lindgren 2014, Osman 2014). Research and theoretical debate on this kind of free labour in the media industries has been lively during the last decade (Banks & Deuze 2009, Banks & Humphreys 2008, Fuchs 2014, Gill & Pratt 2008, Hesmondhalgh 2010). However, the kind of unpaid labour that is conducted during large media events in the form of volunteering has not been given much attention in previous research. Although volunteers are arguably working without salary, their efforts are rewarded with other forms of compensation. For example, in previous research, unpaid media labour has been theorized as "hope" or "aspirational" labour (Duffy 2017, Kuehn & Corrigan 2013), in which the motivation for participating is the hope or implied promise of a future career. Volunteering has also been understood as being motivated by altruism and an aspiration to "do good" (Smith 1981). For the volunteers interviewed for this article, neither career motives nor an aspiration to "do good" were sufficient motivators for performing unpaid labour. Rather, another symbolic currency compensated for and motivated their efforts: participation in and experience of the event, and the sense of belonging that such participation provides. This symbolic currency places demands on the organizers of events such as the ESC, who must provide and organize eventfulness not only as an external experience to the audiences, but also as an internal experience within the organization of volunteers.

This article draws on interviews with volunteers and volunteer organizers of the ESC in Stockholm (May 2016) and in Kyiv (May 2017), complemented with a document analysis of volunteer guidebooks and organizational reports.

Aside from its general theoretical basis regarding volunteering at media events as a form of free labour in the media industries, this article highlights some of the specificities of volunteering in two countries – Sweden and Ukraine. Much of the previous research on volunteering has been conducted within the United Kingdom and the United States, with the specificities that come with those national settings. Ukraine is an especially interesting case, since volunteering in this country has taken on a specific form due to the events of Euromaidan and the Crimean crisis. During the Maidan revolution in 2013, a range of volunteer organizations formed to support and aid the protesters; these organizations have lived on through the current military conflicts in Eastern Ukraine, and have taken on a range of tasks that are usually handled by the state (e.g., healthcare and supplying soldiers with equipment and food). The weak state in Ukraine, together with the rise of volunteerism and the mushrooming of NGOs, has created a "state within the state" (Dunnett 2015): a parallel structure of civil society organizations that uphold many central functions within the country. At first consideration, volunteering at a media event such as the ESC may seem to be completely different from volunteering in a military conflict. However, the way in which the volunteering is organized connects these seemingly different kinds of volunteering, and the participants in our study generally treated them as part of the same "volunteering movement". Sweden is also somewhat of an outlier in international comparisons on volunteering. A widespread idea exists that the volunteering sector in Sweden has been inhibited by the powerful expansion of the Social Democratic welfare state, which has rendered unnecessary or discouraged non-profit involvement and voluntary organization (e.g., Weisbrod 1997). In fact, Lundström and Svedberg (2003) have shown that this is a misunderstanding, at least to some extent. The voluntary sector in Sweden is as strong as that of any other comparable industrial country, whether measured in terms of economic importance, membership figures, or popular participation in voluntary activities (Lundström & Svedberg 2003). Sweden differs from other countries, however, in that its volunteering sector has limited importance in the "core" areas of the welfare state, such as care of the elderly or of children. Another important difference is that voluntary work in Sweden is almost entirely organized through membership organizations (e.g., organizations for pensioners or labour unions). Against this background, volunteering may have different meanings and take on different forms and shapes in different countries.

What is volunteering?

Rochester et al. (2016) distinguish between three distinct paradigms of volunteering. The first is the non-profit paradigm, which is considered in previous scholarly work and in public discourse to be dominant. The second paradigm is volunteering as a form of activism, such as in political or religious movements. The third paradigm, which is the most relevant for this article, is volunteering as a form of "serious leisure". This kind of volunteering is found in the areas of arts and culture, and sports and recreation. Rochester et al. (2016) mention a range of different activities, from one-off occasional volunteering, such as selling hot dogs at one's child's sports event, to more long-term and steady hobby-based activities, such as engagement in an amateur theatre company. A third kind of "serious leisure" identified by Rochester et al. (2016) is a project-based arrangement that is somewhat long-term and that may be organized within a large and complex organization. The ESC is a good example of this form of volunteering, although it differs to some extent from other examples of "serious leisure", which arguably show a stronger focus on small, local, and amateur-based cultural events.

Furthermore, volunteering has traditionally been associated with the so-called "third sector": civil society. To volunteer has been to engage in work outside of the circuits of capital and markets, in a way that is autonomous from both commercial and state interests. According to Salamon and Sokolowski (2016), this conceptualization of a "third sector" might be both too narrow and problematic, however, and the case of the ESC underlines their point. State, commercial, and third-sector interests are highly intertwined in mega-events such as the ESC. NGOs may in effect both be and operate as commercial enterprises, or may be directly and formally tied to the state – a point that will be elaborated further in the empirical section on how volunteering for the ESC is organized.

Free labour and ESC volunteers

The volunteers for the ESC demonstrated a range of altruistic and idealistic intentions and reasons for their engagement in the event. Nevertheless, volunteering in a large-scale cultural and media event contributes to the accumulation of economic capital and can hence be seen as labour, according to the Marxist definition of the term (Fuchs 2014). That is, the work performed by volunteers is a precondition for the event as such to be able to take place and, accordingly, is also a precondition for local and multinational businesses of various sorts to be able to generate profits. Of course, the ESC is a televised music event managed through cooperation within the European Broadcasting Union (EBU) of European public-service broadcasters, so it is not predominantly a commercially driven enterprise. However, as we describe below, the work of volunteering is less tied to the actual music festival and is more a part of creating "brand values" for cities and places.

Within media studies, there has been an intensive debate on unpaid labour during the last decades. In the early 2000s, the issue was discussed mainly in relation to the production of content by users participating in online platforms: digital media had resulted in competition from amateur producers who created media content for pleasure, self-realization, and peer recognition (Arvidsson 2008). This is still very much an issue, and such "exploitation" of users has deepened since then, not least as a consequence of technological developments. However, the debate on unpaid labour has expanded to include much of the service industry, internships, outsourcing, and political initiatives to force the unemployed to do unpaid work (Precarious Workers Brigade and Carrot Workers Collective 2014). An obvious case of unpaid labour in the media industries is the internship system. It is increasingly difficult to enter media-related industries without having performed a significant period of unpaid work at some point in the form of an internship (Frenette 2013, 2015). This development is spurred, at least in part, by the desirability of creative labour and by a simultaneous over-supply of workers (Hesmondhalgh 2010).

Volunteering as a form of unpaid labour has not been extensively discussed in relation to the media industries in previous literature. Media work generally refers to work done by professionals within the media industries; more specifically, it refers to the work done by "symbol creators", or the creators of cultural texts (Hesmondhalgh 2013). Because the media deals in ideas, information, and culture, the management and organization of media work has been seen as somewhat different than in many other organizations; for example, media work is seen as affording a higher degree of autonomy for workers (Deuze 2007). Volunteers at media events such as the ESC are rarely "symbol creators" of this kind, and are seldom directly involved in the production of the television broadcast as a cultural text. Instead, their work must be seen as aligned with what Mayer (2011) discusses as "below-the-line work": the tasks performed by these volunteers are often simple and routine, and the volunteers themselves have neither high status nor influence in the organization. Nevertheless, their efforts, which are both of a practical character (i.e., carrying, building, moving, guarding, etc.) and of a more symbolic and communicative nature (i.e., talking to guests, setting the mood, creating eventfulness), are intrinsic to the media production (i.e., the ESC) and to the event as such. In general, the form of labour that is performed by volunteers at cultural events such as the ESC is a good example of unpaid media work in which, as argued by Fuchs (2014), the boundaries between play, leisure, and labour have become increasingly fuzzy. To describe this phenomenon, Fuchs (2014) introduced the term "play labour", which refers to the fact that exploitation – in the economic sense of the term – increasingly tends to feel like fun and leisure, and thus becomes a part of individuals' free time (122ff).

Free labour entails work that is simultaneously freely given (i.e., unpaid) and enjoyed by those doing it; in addition, it is exploited and constrained. Andrejevic (2009) interprets free labour as a (new) form of capitalist logic whereby the production of community and sociality is "both autonomous of capital and captured by it". In events such as the ESC, the community and sociality are bound up with the notion of an "event" as such – that is, a common shared experience – and, as expressed by several of the participants, with the notion of something "bigger" that the individual work experience is folded into and obtains meaning from. These notions are conceptualized here within the idea of eventfulness. Eventfulness is both the "product" that volunteers produce during the event, and the "experience" that creates meaning for the volunteers and that must be purposefully premeditated, planned, and produced for them by the organizers of the ESC. In sociological theory, an event is "an act or incident" that is clearly contrasted "to the going order of things, its disruption of that order" (Sahlins 1991:45). Events are made to happen and are loaded with the symbolic capacity of transforming or reproducing the structure or the order of things. Eventfulness then, is the experience or feeling of participating in a (significant) event and, as stated by Moore (2011), "specific events is shaped by how their eventfulness and significance comes to be interpreted".

The driving forces behind volunteering have generally been seen as partly altruistic (i.e., wanting to do good for the community at large) and partly egotistic (i.e., wanting to gain work experience, express one's values and beliefs, look for new friends, etc.) (Rehberg 2005, Smith 1981). Motivations can be both individual and social, and can both relate to fundamental human needs (such as belonging and community) and be interpreted as linguistic explanations that people use when asked why they are doing what they are doing (Clary et al. 1998). From such a perspective, motivation is a social construct, and people acquire a repertoire of justifications for their actions that is dependent on cultural and social contexts. In the context discussed here, eventfulness is a key issue; hence, this article will explore how the discursive and rhetorical construction of eventfulness takes place at the "media event" (Dayan & Katz 1992) of the ESC.

Following the framework laid out above, we will address eventfulness as a sort of currency. Volunteering is indeed a form of unpaid labour; however, an important part of volunteers' compensation is the symbolic forms (ideas, stories, identities) they receive, which are intermingled with and support the economic functions of volunteering. The main part of this article involves unpacking and analysing these dimensions of volunteering. As we will show, volunteering is largely about eventfulness, and an understanding of the role of eventfulness is crucial for a full understanding of the political economy of contemporary volunteering in the media industries.

Entry points

This article is based on interviews with the volunteers and the organizers of the volunteers during the 2016 ESC in Stockholm and the 2017 ESC in Kyiv (see Table 1 for an overview).

Informant 1	Volunteer, woman, 20s. Kyiv.
Informant 2	Volunteer, woman, 20s. Kyiv.
Informant 3	Volunteer, woman, 20s. Kyiv.
Informant 4	Volunteer, woman, 20s. Kyiv.
Informant 5	Volunteer, woman, 20s. Kyiv.
Informant 6	Volunteer, woman, 20s. Kyiv.
Informant 7	Team leader, woman, 20s. Kyiv.
Informant 8	Team leader, woman, 20s. Kyiv.
Informant 9	Volunteer trainer, woman, 50s. Kyiv.
Informant 10	Volunteer organizer, man, 40s. Kyiv.
Informant 11	Volunteer organizer, woman, 40s. Kyiv.
Informant 12	Volunteer organizer, woman, 40s. Stockholm.
Informant 13	Volunteer, woman, 50s. Stockholm.
Informant 14	Volunteer, woman, 20s. Stockholm.
Informant 15	Intern at the communication department at the Stockholm municipality, man, 20s.

Table 1. Overview of the participants in the study.

The participants were recruited in different ways. In Sweden, we obtained assistance from the volunteer coordinator employed by the Stockholm municipality. In Kyiv, Golovko used personal contacts, professional networks, and social media to contact and recruit volunteers and people working with the volunteer organization in the Ukraine. The interviews in Stockholm were conducted after the event, in June and during the fall of 2016. In Kyiv, we were part of a larger research group that did fieldwork on several aspects of the ESC in Ukraine. We visited the capital during the week of the ESC (May 7–14, 2017) and conducted the interviews at that time. The bulk of the Ukrainian interviews were conducted in English, although Golovko also translated questions into Russian or Ukrainian. During the event in Kyiv, we also had the opportunity to observe the volunteers in action – both in the city centre, where they worked at five ESC locations, and at the broadcasting location outside the city centre. The interviews lasted for 30–90 minutes and were recorded. In addition to the interviews, we used written materials: mainly the volunteer handbooks (from Stockholm and Kyiv, respectively), but also the

Stockholm city council reports summarizing the results from the 2016 ESC. The material was transcribed and analysed thematically according to five broad questions: (1) What do the volunteers at this media event do? (2) How is volunteering organized? (3) How do the volunteers themselves understand their role? (4) What motivates volunteers at large media events such as the ESC? and (5) How does the organization/leadership work to create and uphold motivation?

Organizing volunteering

There were significant differences in how volunteering was organized in the two ESC events that we followed. In Sweden, the municipality of Stockholm had a total of 450 volunteers that were engaged in the event. In Ukraine, the municipality of Kyiv had a single volunteering operation with about 500 volunteers. This operation was not, however, directly organized by the city of Kyiv; rather, it was run through an organization called Volonter, which can be described as something between an NGO and a private corporation. In addition to these volunteers, who mainly worked within the city of Kyiv, the television broadcaster organized 900 volunteers who worked at the ESC arena and with the television production.

Using volunteers for a large event such as the ESC requires a professional organization with paid employees who recruit, train, and manage the volunteers before and during the event. In the Swedish case, the entire organization that was needed for the volunteer operation was created in-house within the Stockholm municipality organization. The head of the volunteers was borrowed from the Stockholm Tourist Agency (a public enterprise), and the team leaders and managers were chosen from different municipal companies and administrations, and were temporarily taken from their ordinary jobs for the period of the ESC (two weeks in May). In the Ukrainian case, the situation was different. The 500 volunteers employed by the city of Kyiv were recruited and trained by the British company People First, which describes itself as a "multisector recruiter" on its company webpage (people-first.co.uk, 2017-09-08). Furthermore, the volunteers were not managed through the municipality, but by a semi-private organization (Volonter). In Ukraine, it is not unusual for NGOs – rather than the state or municipal governments – to organize the greater part of the administration and governance of the country. Volonter is one example of an NGO/private enterprise with close ties to the political sphere; for example, it is headed by the mayor of Kyiv, Vitali Klytjko.

The politics and economics of volunteers at the ESC

Volunteering at an event like the ESC is connected to political and economic ambitions regarding "city branding" and "stimulating the volunteer sector" in public administration. It is also connected to economic motives regarding savings to be made in public budgets, and to a surrounding volunteer industry that is responsible for recruiting, hiring, and training volunteers.

As pointed out by Holst-Kjær (2011), cultural events such as the ESC – and the way in which they are used and framed among political and economic elites – exemplify the recent debate in cultural policy and experience economy about the "cool city". The premise for these debates is that it is important for a city to have the right "brand value" in order to attract the "right" kind of inhabitants and businesses, and in order for the city to flourish (Ashworth & Kavaratzis 2016; Kavaratzis 2004). For politicians and policy-makers, it hence becomes increasingly important not only to govern, but also to market, communicate, and brand the city. To host the ESC is seen as (and used as) an opportunity to establish the image of the host city. An important part of this opportunity is that the host city chooses the overall theme and "tagline" for the event, which is used in all communication and marketing, and which is intended to communicate the values that the branding and marketing teams from the host city want to associate with that city. In Stockholm, the tagline for the event was "Come Together"; in Ukraine, it was "Celebrate Diversity". In many ways, these catchphrases seem to be (and are) empty signifiers that anyone is free to fill with meaning and interpretations. However, the general intention behind them and the interpretation of them (among commentators, the public, people working with the event, etc.) relate not only to branding issues but also to political issues – such as the need for unity and friendship in Europe and among Europeans, or the need for respect and tolerance for difference. The volunteers in both Sweden and Ukraine were understood – by their managers and by themselves – to be the representatives and bearers of the content of these slogans. The volunteers described how, during their training, they "discussed in groups what it means to be the ambassador of the country and how to be a great volunteer" (Informant 4) as well as "the history of the tagline – how to understand the meaning of 'celebrate diversity'" (Informant 9). However, the expression of political meaning that is inherent in having volunteers "represent" the tagline – which is politically and economically motivated and defined – is not the only way in which volunteering is related to political and economic power. In the case of the ESC, the event is directly organized (i.e., recruiting, training, employing volunteers) through public authorities that are politically governed. In both Stockholm and Kyiv, the municipal authorities and political actors understood the large scale of the volunteer organization of the ESC to be a way of stimulating and exploring possibilities for engaging volunteers in future public work projects. In the Ukrainian case, this concept has taken the form of a growing "volunteer movement" that encompasses an increasing number of societal sectors. Our informants explicitly connected this movement to the ongoing political and military crisis in the country. For example, in the words of the Ukrainian organizer of the volunteers:

> The situation has changed after the revolution in 2014. These days, a lot of young people become volunteers during the Eurovision to do something useful for the country. The volunteering in Ukraine is developing very fast and rapidly. Especially, it became noticeable after the Euromaidan. (Informant 10)

In the interviews, the volunteers themselves elaborated further:

> The volunteer movement in Ukraine is becoming stronger; it has a long history, but now it's starting to be normal to be a volunteer – that you do something… and help people. We also talked about this during training – that you shouldn't stop being a volunteer just because Eurovision ends. Volunteering is something you can, and should be [doing], every day, always. (Informant 2)

This perspective of volunteering does not only relate to the specific Ukrainian political situation; it is also connected to more general tendencies to increasingly use and exploit unpaid or low-paid labour (e.g., interns, the "gig economy", contributors of material to digital networks, etc.). Unlike commercial companies, public bodies receive no direct economic profit from such volunteering. Of course, savings can be made in public budgets as volunteering becomes more widespread and common in different forms of activities. This was also clearly understood and elaborated by the informants, who in the interviews regularly commented on the fact that they were used in order to "save money" on behalf of the organizers and that their services were contributing to the event, "while we of course work for free". (Informants 3, 4, and 5). Traditionally, most volunteer work has been organized in the so-called "third sector", or civil society. In the case of the ESC (and other similar mega-events) the state, the market and corporate world, and the third sector intermingle in complex ways, which introduces – sometimes directly and sometimes indirectly – a corporate profit motive into the area of volunteer work. In the Ukrainian case, the situation is even more complicated, as private corporations often take the form and shape of NGOs, while simultaneously having strong formal links to state power and political interests. To summarize, volunteering at cultural events such as the ESC is strongly connected to various political and economic goals and ambitions. These include savings in public budgets, profits for the host city, profits for different companies in the "volunteering industry" that supply and train volunteers, and – most importantly – city branding, to which volunteers can contribute and add to the "brand value" of the host city by increasing the eventfulness of the ESC as a media and cultural event.

Enhancing eventfulness: The work of volunteering at the ESC

Volunteering at the ESC can entail a range of different things; however, volunteers generally perform routine tasks that must be done but that are too expensive to use waged labour to carry out. One of the participants describes these tasks as follows:

> We help people, guide them, answer questions, entertain them; we also move things, carry equipment, and so on. We work all the time; there is always something to do, and no time to just hang around or rest. (Informant 4)

The above description, which was given by one of the volunteers from Kyiv, is a typical one. Most of the volunteers we interviewed worked as cloakroom attendants, gatekeepers to clubs and VIP areas, drivers, and crew in information centres. During the 2017 ESC in Kyiv, volunteers also worked directly with the television production, including script-writing and stage work.

Labour law and the collective agreements between unions and employers affect what volunteers are permitted to do. In Sweden, it is fairly difficult to have proper jobs be performed by volunteers – at least, the tasks volunteers perform cannot be described as proper jobs. One of our informants, a PR assistant for the municipality of Stockholm, told us how he was scolded by his manager for using the word "work" in a press release about the volunteers of the 2016 ESC, since "it is of utmost importance that we do not openly describe what they do as a form of work" (Informant 15). In the Volunteer's Handbook for the 2016 ESC in Stockholm, the activity of volunteering is described as "being an ambassador" (i.e., of the event, of the city of Stockholm, and of Sweden), "offering good service", and "spreading magic". It is notable that none of the descriptions in the Handbook mention words such as work or labour. The organizers of the 2017 ESC in Kyiv were not as strict as those in Stockholm; the manager in charge of the volunteering organization in Kyiv spoke more openly in terms of the volunteers working and performing a proper job. For example, she commented on the long shifts of the volunteers as follows:

> To be a volunteer is hard work, they work for long periods of time. It

> is impossible to organize them in shifts, so at least some of them must work for 12 hours straight. Therefore, they need to be well-motivated. (Informant 11)

However, in both cases, there was a significant tendency on the part of the organizers and managers not to describe volunteering as an essential part of the event, but rather to describe it as adding something extra, contributing to the festive feeling, and setting the mood of the event – as if the volunteers were mainly a kind of decoration used to create an eventful atmosphere in the host city. For example, the Swedish head of volunteering described the purpose of volunteering as "adding something extra, putting a filter of festivity over the whole event" (Informant 12).

Beyond routine tasks, one key role that volunteers played in these events was that of visibility. Their contribution to the "positive buzz" and the feel of festivity that the organizers sought to produce came first and foremost by their presence: the physical presence of their bodies on the street. The Eurovision event stretches out over a period of two weeks. During the first week, artists and their crews, fans, and tourists start arriving in the host city. The second week entails the broadcasting events, the two semi-finals, and the concluding Eurovision final on Saturday evening. During the entirety of this period, in both Stockholm and Kyiv, volunteers were stationed at several locations in the downtown area where participants and guests of the events were supposed to meet, mingle, and experience various cultural programmes such as concerts. These so-called "Eurovision zones", located in city squares, were places where the event took on a material form and shape beyond the televisual experience of the broadcasting of Eurovision. The volunteers occupied the scene at these zones, marking with their very presence the fact that something was going on. According to Scannell (2002), events are human-made moments that stand out from the ordinary flow of everyday experience; events have a "prospective meaningful character" (ibid.). Events are prepared, eagerly awaited, and invested with expectations; most importantly, they are designed to give us a positively anticipated experience (i.e., we look forward to the experience of being part of the event). The Eurovision zones and the presence of volunteers are designed to create expectation and anticipation (i.e., that the Eurovision event will take place); however, they also mark an "out-of-the-ordinary" moment: something is happening. Thus, the volunteers are there to be seen. This perspective came up in the interviews, as follows:

> I'm in my uniform. I have my pass. And everyone sees that I am a part of this. And everyone pays attention and looks. And it's cool. I like it. (Informant 3)

In addition to creating the feeling that something out of the ordinary is occurring, volunteering during cultural events such as the ESC creates a sense of urgency: something is happening right now. Borrowing a term from television studies, we can say that in this sense, volunteers contribute to the "liveness" of the event (Auslander 2008) – that is, they help create an atmosphere in which visitors feel that they are participating in something that is being played out at this moment.

This combination of presence and "liveness" creates the eventfulness that is sought by the organizers and that is a key feature of volunteering in cultural events, in addition to practical and routine volunteering tasks. Another important element in creating festivity and a sense of eventfulness is the message of abundance that volunteers send through their presence at the key sites of the event. As stated by the volunteer organizer in Stockholm:

> Honestly, I can say that…we actually had volunteers to offer a kind of extra and spectacular hosting. That is what it is about, you know. The event itself, of course we could host this event entirely without volunteers. But if we have them, it gives something more, something extra. (Informant 12)

Volunteers are present to send a message of care. The services provided by volunteers are generally not necessary in the strictest sense of the term. There are maps for those who need to find their way through the city, and there are police officers for those who feel unsafe. However, the deployment of volunteers at the key sites of the event is as much about symbolic labour as it is about actual, concrete work: it shows that effort is being made to take care of guests and visitors.

Experiencing eventfulness: Motivations for volunteering at the ESC

In this final part of the analysis, we will move on to show that eventfulness is not only an effect of the volunteers' work, or a mood that they must share in order to express it to guests and visitors; it is also a central symbolic currency that is used to "buy" the labour power of volunteer workers. As discussed above, in theories of free labour, such labour is generally described as simultaneously freely given and enjoyed by those doing it, while also being exploited and constrained. The "enjoyment" of such work has often been seen as unproblematic and natural, and not as something that is actively produced and maintained by those organizing the labour. However, the example of ESC volunteering shows that this "enjoyment" of free labour is a crucial form of renumeration that is acknowledged and actively produced by the "buyers" of labour (i.e., the organizers of the ESC).

Among the participants in this study, no one expressed hope or anticipation that volunteering would benefit their future career in the media and cultural industries (or elsewhere). The people we interviewed were not particularly interested in – or fans of – the ESC as such, even though we had expected this to be an important reason for volunteering at the ESC. To some extent, other altruistic motivations were expressed by the participants, such as "helping our nation" and "doing something for the community" (Informants 1, 3, 5, 8, and 13). Most importantly, however, the people we interviewed for this article expressed the motivations of wanting to be a part of the event and wanting to experience the extraordinariness and eventfulness of the event as such. The ESC can be understood as a "media event", as defined by Dayan and Katz (1992) in their study on media events (c.f. Ericson et al. 2002). The ESC is a large-scale symbolic event with possible social consequences, and a central dimension of the ESC is the eventfulness that it entails and that must also be produced by the organizers of the event. This perspective was expressed in most of the interviews that we conducted, both in Sweden and in Ukraine. For example:

> The emotions that I get from the volunteering are what I get back. And being part of something BIG makes me the happiest person ever. (Informant 4)

> So, it's like to be a part of something that is all over the world. To be part of something bigger. (Informant 1)

> The emotions it evokes, the grand look of the arena and this happy and festive mood – that is what makes me engaged in this event. (Informant 6)

> I like being, I like that feeling that I am a small part of something big. That I am involved in something that is so huge, so big, that the whole world knows about it. (Informant 5)

This view relates to the point made by Nick Couldry (2000) about the mystique and allure of the actual sites of mediated spectacles: that those spaces, mundane as they might be, draw people in as "pilgrims" seeking to visit, witness, and partake in the "place of media power". For Couldry, this attests to the ideological notion of the media as being "the centre of society", and pilgrimages to the sites of media spectacle reinforce this notion. In a similar vein, the volunteers at the ESC seek participation and belonging to "something bigger" at the very mundane and everyday sites where the televised spectacle of the ESC "hits the street". At the same time as the volunteers talk about their hopes to belong and feel "part of something" in the interviews, the actual work and routine tasks that they perform, as described above, seem to distance them from the event and from the eventfulness of the ESC. Volunteers sometimes work in areas that are remote from the "action" (i.e., from the actual broadcasts or festivities). Even when they do work at locations that are central to the event, the tasks that volunteers perform draw them out of the general eventfulness. This is acknowledged by the managers of the volunteers; in fact, the managers work to include the volunteers in the event and to maintain the spirit of the event among them. This is done, for example, by providing continual information about what is going on in the main arena, through social media updates, and through continual pep talks to maintain volunteers' focus on what the event is about.

One of the Kyiv volunteers described how the management worked hard to "get us to feel like a part of the event", through:

> …written programmes and showrunners for each location, we have team meetings every day with information about what is going on. We also get uniforms such as T-shirts, jackets, baseball caps, and special badges with public transportation cards; that separates us from all other people and it makes us feel "special", or as a team, as real participants. We also have our Facebook groups, and there is lots of stuff to do and participate in. (Informant 3)

The organizers and managers of the volunteering at both the events underlined the importance of "creating an experience" for the volunteers. For example, the head of volunteering at the 2016 ESC in Stockholm stated:

> It is of great importance that this becomes a positive experience for the volunteers themselves. We really wanted to create an experience for the volunteers. We only had two weeks to do it, but we really wanted to boost them as much as we possibly could so that they would leave the event feeling like, "Wow!". (Informant 12)

To enhance (or create) a feeling of eventfulness and belonging among the volunteers, the organizers used a range of tools, some of which are commonplace in team-building activities in working life in general, and others that are unique in volunteering.

The focus on belonging and eventfulness began early, during volunteer training before the events in May. Several days of training in preparation occurred in both Stockholm and Kyiv (Fig. 1). As mentioned above, language, security, and

Fig. 1. Volunteers engaged in a team-building task during the training.

basic Eurovision knowledge were part of the training; another part of the training was to prepare the participants to play the role of volunteers in the street and to act as visible elements "representing" the event. Hence, as formulated by the head of volunteering in Stockholm, an integral part of the training was "to set the mood" among the volunteers. In Kyiv, one of the staff members responsible for the training described it as follows:

> One of the most important aims of the training is to create a feeling that they (volunteers) are a part of the team. In other words, it is a team-building activity in many ways…to keep up volunteers' enthusiasm and excitement. (Informant 9)

Parties and ceremonies for the volunteers were also important in enhancing the feeling of eventfulness and of being a part of the event. Such events were hosted in Kyiv and in Stockholm both before and after the ESC. For example, on April 25, 2017, the 900 volunteers gathered in the main square of Kyiv for an opening ceremony. To make it even more official, the mayor of Kyiv, Vitali Klytjko, delivered a welcoming and inspiring speech. He thanked the volunteers for their devotion and for their desire to make Kyiv a city that foreign guests would remember forever. He also highlighted everyone's responsibility for the guests' impressions during their time in Kyiv. "But I am sure, they will be only positive ones", he concluded. Following Klytjko's speech, the event manager of Eurovision, Kyrylo Voronin, and a former ESC winner, the artist Ruslana Lyzhychko, wished the volunteers the best of luck in their job; then hundreds of blue balloons flew into the sky (Fig. 2).

The training, ceremonies, and parties were important before and after the event took place. In the weeks of the ESC itself, however, there was no time for such things. During the event, the most important tool that was used to maintain the feeling of eventfulness and community was social media. As mentioned above, volunteers' tasks during events such as the ESC are often tedious, and may be removed from the centre of the event. Therefore, social media can facilitate the feeling of being a part of the event as it unfolds (see Kaun & Uldam 2018 for an analysis of the interrelation between social media and volunteering).

Fig. 2. Blue balloons fly into the sky at the opening ceremony for the ESC volunteers in Kyiv, as the prior winner of ESC, Ruslana Lyzhychko, waves to the crowd of volunteers

A closed Facebook group, initiated by the National Television Channel, was central in this respect. The organizers tried to gather all the volunteers into one group to create a virtual space where they could make friends and share their experience. There was even a special media team that took photos of volunteers at work and posted them on the Facebook page in order to boost the immediacy and "liveness" of the work itself, and to help the volunteers experience a sense of belonging and immersion in the event. The manager of the volunteers at the National Public Broadcasting Company of Ukraine (UA:PBC) in Kyiv said:

> We also have the volunteer media team. Two volunteers are specially assigned to take photos and videos of the volunteers during their work. It is not allowed for the volunteers to shoot photos and videos. They should work; they should not take autographs and take selfies with celebrities. It is not allowed to post photos of the event in social media. We

> have a Facebook page and they (media volunteers) are moderating this page and posting the photos. (Informant 11)

Considering what the event managers say and do to organize volunteering for a cultural and media event such as the ESC, it is evident that the experience of eventfulness is a key element, not only for the visitors to the event, but also for the volunteer staff. This experience can be interpreted as a key resource that the organizers must produce, enhance, and manage in order to motivate the volunteers and maintain their interest in undertaking the free labour that is necessary for the event to take place.

Conclusion

This article discusses how volunteering is an important form of media work that takes place in relation to large media events such as the ESC, and thereby presents a perspective of volunteering that has been somewhat overlooked in the previous literature. We argue that such volunteering activities must be seen as intrinsic parts of the event, and that the work done by volunteers is a form of labour. We view volunteering at major media events as labour in two ways: first, it is part of the production of economic surplus for the organizers of these major events; and second, it plays an important role in the production of "brand value" for the cities, municipalities, and countries that are attempting to use the event for place-branding purposes.

Since volunteering must be seen as a form of unpaid or free labour, the question of motivations and social values becomes important. This article shows that eventfulness is an essential part of what volunteer labour brings to an event such as the ESC. It is also a key element in the production of economic value: eventfulness is a currency that expresses the value of the event itself and is a key feature of place branding. Furthermore, eventfulness – along with the feeling of being a part of an event, of something bigger, as it unfolds in time – is a key feature of the motivation of the volunteers who contribute with unpaid labour. As such, eventfulness can also be understood as a form of currency or symbolic capital that forms the main remuneration or "wage" earned by volunteers at an event such as the ESC. However, the currency of eventfulness is not necessarily spontaneously produced as the event unfolds; there is a risk that the experience of volunteering will fall into uneventfulness, as volunteering tasks are often both routine and remote from the actual event. Therefore, the organizers in both Kyiv and Stockholm had to premeditate, plan, and produce eventfulness for the volunteers. At huge media events such as the ESC, the organizers work to produce eventfulness not only as a value for the consumers of the event (i.e., the audience in front of the television and the people gathering onsite), but also as an internal experience within the organization and for the volunteers. If anything, this finding points to the fact that no labour is ever entirely unpaid, and that while volunteering is indeed a form of free labour, an important part of the compensation that volunteers receive is a feeling of identity and belonging that comes with the experience of eventfulness.

These findings may contribute to the field of research on voluntary work, as they demonstrate – in line with the work of Salomon and Sokolowski (2016), for example – the complexity and messiness of relations between volunteering and the state and market. The third sector of civil society is often intertwined with commercial and political powers, which is especially true in the Ukrainian case; voluntary actions might hence be circumscribed within the logics of capital and state, with a range of possible – but somewhat overlooked – consequences to be elaborated in further research. Furthermore, commercial interests and for-profit companies can – and have been reported to – seek ways to exploit the idea of volunteering; for example, they may recruit "volunteers" instead of interns as increased labour regulation and policy make it increasingly difficult to use unpaid interns as a resource.

The findings presented here may also contribute to research on media work and work in the cultural industries, as they highlight how so-called free labour, or "playbour", includes specific forms of "wage" or renumeration that must be actively premeditated and produced by employers or by those who wish to use unpaid workers. How this happens, what kind of work goes into this, and with what consequences have only been touched upon in this article, and more work is necessary. The results from this study also urge us to widen the empirical scope in studies of media work to include groups such as interns and volunteers, in analyses of how media and cultural events are produced and come to be.

Fredrik Stiernstedt is Associate Professor in Media Studies at Södertörn University, Sweden. His research concerns work and labour in the media and cultural industries, as well as issues of social class and media. E-mail: fredrik.stiernstedt@sh.se

Irina Golovka holds a Master of Arts from Södertörn University and the research conducted for this article was part of her master thesis.

References

Andrejevic, Mark (2009): "Exploiting YouTube: Contradictions of User-Generated Labor," Pelle Snickars & Patrick Vonderau (eds): *The YouTube Reader*, Stockholm: National Library of Sweden, 406–424.

Arvidsson, Adam (2008): "The Ethical Economy of Customer Coproduction," *Journal of Macromarketing,* 28:4, 326–338.

Ashworth, Gregory, and Mihalis Kavaratzis (2016): "Cities of Culture and Culture in Cities: The Emerging Uses of Culture in City Branding," Tigras Haas & Krister Olsson (eds): *Emergent Urbanism: Urban Planning & Design in Times of Structural and Systemic Change*, London & New York: Routledge, 73–80.

Auslander, Philip (2008): *Liveness: Performance in a Mediatized Culture*, London & New York: Routledge.

Banks, John & Mark Deuze (2009): "Co-Creative Labour," *International Journal of Cultural Studies,* 12:5, 419–431.

Banks, John & Sal Humphreys (2008): "The Labour of User Co-Creators: Emergent Social Network Markets?" *Convergence,* 14:4, 401–418.

Clary, E. Gil, Mark Snyder, Robert D. Ridge, John Copeland, Arthur A. Stukas, Julie Haugen & Peter Miene (1998): "Understanding and Assessing the Motivations of Volunteers: A Functional Approach," *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 74:6, 1516.

Couldry, Nick (2000): *The Place of Media Power: Pilgrims and Witnesses of the Media Age*, London: Routledge.

Dayan, D. & E. Katz (1992): *Media Events: The Live Broadcasting of History*, Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.

Deuze, Mark (2007): *Media Work*, Cambridge: Polity.

Duffy, Brooke Erin (2017): (*Not) Getting Paid to Do What You Love: Gender, Social Media, and Aspirational Work*, Yale: Yale University Press.

Dunnett, Chris (2015): "How Volunteers Created A 'Second State' Inside Ukraine. Massive and Unprecedented Volunteer Movement Fills the Void Where the State Fails," *Hromadske International*, Jan 31, 2015.

Ericson, Staffan (red.) (2002): *Hello Europe! Tallinn calling!: Eurovision Song Contest 2002 som mediehändelse*, Huddinge: Medie- och kommunikationsvetenskap, Södertörns högskola.

Frenette, Alexandre (2013): "Making the Intern Economy: Role and Career Challenges of the Music Industry Intern," *Work and Occupations*, 40:4, 364–397.

Frenette, Alexandre (2015): "From Apprenticeship to Internship: The Social and Legal Antecedents of the Intern Economy," *TripleC: Communication, Capitalism & Critique. Open Access Journal for a Global Sustainable Information Society,* 13:2, 351–360.

Fuchs, Christian (2014): *Digital Labour and Karl Marx*, London & New York: Routledge.

Gill, Rosalind, and Andy Pratt (2008): "In the Social Factory? Immaterial Labour, Precariousness and Cultural Work," *Theory, Culture & Society*, 25:7–8, 1–30.

Hesmondhalgh, David (2010): "User-Generated Content, Free Labour and the Cultural Industries," *Ephemera,* 10:3-4, 267–284.

Hesmondhalgh, David (2013): *The Cultural Industries*, London: SAGE.

Holst-Kjær, Sarah (2011) "Meaningful-Experience Creation and Event Management: A Post-Event Analysis of Copenhagen Carnival 2009," *Culture Unbound: Journal of Current Cultural Research,* 3:2, 243–267.

Kaun, Anne & Julie Uldam (2018): "'Volunteering is like any other business': Civic participation and social media," *New Media & Society*, 20:6, 2186-2207.

Kavaratzis, Michalis (2004): "From City Marketing to City Branding: Towards a Theoretical Framework for Developing City Brands," *Place Branding,* 1:1, 58–73.

Kuehn, Kathleen, and Thomas F. Corrigan (2013): "Hope Labor: The Role of Employ-

ment Prospects in Online Social Production," *The Political Economy of Communication*, 1:1, 9–25.
Lindgren, Simon (2014): "Crowdsourcing Knowledge Interdiscursive Flows from Wikipedia into Scholarly Research," *Culture Unbound: Journal of Current Cultural Research*, 6:3, 609–627.
Lundström, Tommy & Lars Svedberg (2003): "The Voluntary Sector in a Social Democratic Welfare State–The Case of Sweden," *Journal of Social Policy,* 32:2, s. 217–238.
Mayer, Vicki (2011): *Below the Line: Producers and Production Studies in the New Television Economy*, Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press.
Moore, Adam (2011): "The Eventfulness of Social Reproduction," *Sociological Theory*, 29:4, 294-314.
Osman, Kim (2014): "The Free Encyclopaedia That Anyone Can Edit: The Shifting Values of Wikipedia Editors," *Culture Unbound: Journal of Current Cultural Research,* 6, 593–607.
People First (2017): people-first.co.uk (accessed 17/09/08).
Precarious Workers Brigade and Carrot Workers Collective (2014): "Free Labour Syndrome. Volunteer Work and Unpaid Overtime in the Creative and Cultural Sector," *JOY FOREVER*, 211.
Rehberg, Walter (2005): "Altruistic Individualists: Motivations for International Volunteering among Young Adults in Switzerland," *Voluntas: International Journal of Voluntary and Nonprofit Organizations* 16:2, 109–122.
Rochester, Colin, A. Ellis Paine, Steven Howlett, Meta Zimmeck & Angela Ellis Paine (2016): *Volunteering and Society in the 21st Century*, Berlin: Springer.
Sahlins, Marchall (1991): "The Return of the Event, Again: With Reflections on the Beginnings of the Great Fijian War of 1843 to 1855 Between the Kingdoms of Bau and Rewa," Aletta Biersack (ed): *Clio in Oceania: Toward a Historical Anthropology*, Washington, DC: Smithsonian Institution Press, 37–100.
Salamon, L. M., & S. W. Sokolowski (2016): "Beyond Nonprofits: Re-Conceptualizing the Third Sector," *VOLUNTAS: International Journal of Voluntary and Nonprofit Organizations*, 27:4, 1515-1545.
Scannell, Paddy (2002): "Big Brother as a Television Event," *Television & New Media,* 3:3, 271–282.
Smith, David Horton (1981): "Altruism, Volunteers, and Volunteerism*," Journal of Voluntary Action Research,* 10:1, 21–36.
Weisbrod, Burton A. (1997): "The Future of the Nonprofit Sector: Its Entwining with Private Enterprise and Government," *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*, 541–555.

Culture Unbound
Journal of Current Cultural Research

In Good Condition
The Discourse of Patina as seen in Interactions between Experts and Laymen in the Antiques Trade

By Karin Wagner

Abstract

This article examines how notions of patina are conveyed by experts in the antiques trade. How do antiques experts convey perceptions of patina to their clients and audience? How do they explain, persuade, and put forward their standards of condition? Three examples are analysed, a conversation about a sundial from the Swedish *Antiques Roadshow*, a conversation about a toy car from the British *Antiques Roadshow* and a vintage watches collecting guide from Christie's auction house. Different persuasive strategies and styles used by the experts to convey their norms are identified. A change towards higher appreciation of patina can be discerned. Furthermore, the article analyses patina in regard to the relationship between surface and core of an object and in regard to use and usefulness. It is suggested that objects with patina are popular because we as humans feel an affinity with them. If things have a life trajectory, it will also involve ageing, and by surrounding ourselves with old, imperfect things we can come to terms with our own ageing process.

Keywords: patina, antiques, discourse analysis, consumption, antiques trade, *Antiques Roadshow*

Wagner, Karin: "In Good Condition: The Discourse of Patina as seen in Interactions between Experts and Laymen in the Antiqes Trade", *Culture Unbound*, Volume 11, issue 2, 2019: 252–274. Published by Linköping University Electronic Press: http://www.cultureunbound.ep.liu.se

Introduction

Old things carry a story. Like people, things can be seen to have a social or cultural biography (Appadurai 1986; Kopytoff 1986). Old things have a character and an appeal that new things do not possess (Balthazar 2016). One way of denoting this quality is by way of patina. However, this is a rather elusive concept, which can operate in different contexts, even if not explicitly referred to. One such context is the antiques trade, which will be the focus of this article. Collecting antiques is no longer reserved for the wealthy, it has become a popular hobby among broader social groups, stimulated by television shows with a large audience like *Antiques Roadshow*, that can even be regarded as cult popular culture, according to sociologist Katherine Walker (2012). Antiques experts are often connoisseurs in a broader sense, and can take on different roles depending on the context they appear in, as for instance experts in antiques TV shows, as owners of auction houses, as private collectors or as writers. When experts give advice the communication form is often dialogic, both in TV shows and auction houses' collecting guides, as will be shown in this article. The main purpose of the article is to discern how notions of patina are conveyed by experts in the antiques trade. Questions that have guided me in this study are: How is patina perceived and valued in the antiques trade? How do antiques experts convey perceptions of patina to their clients and audience? How do they explain, persuade, and put forward their standards of condition? What is the appeal of things with patina?

The antiques trade is part of a second hand culture, which in turn is part of larger trend towards a more sustainable consumption. The antiques trade occupies a prominent position in the hierarchy of second hand culture, but the borders are fluent:

> The relationship between rubbish and value is unclear, complex, convoluted; transfers and shifts occur between and across cultural categories which are themselves fuzzy and striated: at one end is rubbish, at the other is high (commercial and aesthetic) value, but in between are a range of possible object: value relations, gradations which include junk, debris, trash and kitsch on the one hand, and heirloom, antique and treasure on the other. (Gregson & Crewe 2003: 115)

One case in point is retro retailing, that took off in the 1960s, and which offered for sale "objects that were quirky, unique and not well established in design hierarchies" (Baker 2012: 624). At contemporary online auctions, rusty industrial cabinets are sold alongside expensive jewellery, and goods can be shipped to clients in distant locations. Before, the sales venue, such as the retro shop, played an important role (Baker 2012), while the current second hand culture has to a great extent been globalised (Appelgren & Bohlin 2015). Whereas some people feel that they lead a more sustainable life by buying second hand, other people opt to stay out of the circulation altogether, by hoarding things that would otherwise be thrown away. They regard themselves as custodians of things and attempt to use commodities to counteract consumer culture (Cherrier 2010). A more moderate stance is taken by consumers who shop second hand in order to be seen as unique and creative and to avoid the impersonal feel of goods that come straight from the factory. Buying used goods can be more demanding and require an ability to put things together and design a style of one's own, compared to buying a complete, modern style from mainstream shops (Balthazar 2016). Instead of a downward spiral of wear and decay, the circulation of goods can be seen as a process of growing, whereby things take on new meanings and qualities. They can create connections between times and places and bring out and activate memories (Appelgren & Bohlin 2015).

The *Antiques Roadshow* show provides a good opportunity to examine how the discourse of patina is shaped in the interaction between experts and laymen. Antiques experts are authorities that set the note of the discourse on condition of objects. As critical multimodal discourse analysis targets power relations and authority (Machin & Mayr 2012), it will be a suitable methodological approach to determine how antiques experts convey their norms to their clients and audience and how they explain, persuade, and put forward their arguments about the proper condition. I will analyse three main examples, a conversation from the Swedish *Antiques Roadshow*, a conversation from the British *Antiques Roadshow* and a collecting guide from Christie's auction house. The objects concerned differ in age and context of production and use, but all three examples rely on the interaction between expert and visitor/collector and give evidence of specific attitudes to patina, although in different media. The first two examples are film clips from TV shows and the third example is a web page with text and images. Multimodal analysis is suitable for the audio-visual media that forms the core of the material of the study. As a visual studies scholar, I will pay attention to gestures, body language, gaze, but also to tone and level of voice, and different linguistic markers. Apart from the shows themselves, I have made use of books and online magazines about *Antiques Roadshows.*

The discourse on patina is made up of many statements in different media, which is why a mix of methods is necessary in order to capture this discourse. My material also consists of two interviews conducted in 2017 with antiques dealers, one with a manager at a major auction house and one with the owner of an online auction site, both with long experience from the antiques trade. When visiting the auction house, I also made observations and took photographs of the display of goods. Notes were taken during interviews and observations. Another category of material that I have consulted and that is important for the understanding of the discourse on patina is the diverse range of publications such as newsletters, online discussion forums, essays by furniture restorers, and auction house websites. Together with the interviews, these publications serve as voices from the trade.

The concept of patina

According to Merriam-Webster Dictionary, patina is defined as

> **1.** a usually green film formed on copper and bronze by long exposure or by chemicals and often valued aesthetically
>
> **2.** a surface appearance (as a coloring or mellowing) of something grown beautiful especially with age or use

Although patina originally applied to metals, it is the second, broader definition of patina that will be used in this article.

If we turn to an actor in the antiques trade, a furniture restorer gives the following explanation of patina on their web page:

> What is a patina? A patina is a natural change to the surface of an object caused by oxidization, sunlight or dust/dirt. Patination is considered to be an unavoidable change to a piece as compared to an accidental stain such as that caused by spilling something on the item. Patination helps tell the story of an item and, as such, adds value. (Rahn's Furniture Restoration 2015)

Michael Flanigan, an antiques dealer and an *Antiques Roadshow* appraiser in the American version of the show, is cited by freelance writer Dennis Gaffney, in one of his articles for the *Antiques Roadshow* online:

> "Patina is everything that happens to an object over the course of time," Michael says. "The nick in the leg of a table, a scratch on a table top, the loss of moisture in the paint, the crackling of a finish or a glaze in ceramics, the gentle wear patterns on the edge of a plate. All these things add up to create a softer look, subtle color changes, a character. Patina is built from all the effects, natural and man-made, that create a true antique". (Gaffney 2008)

From these examples of definitions, we can infer that patina is a positively charged concept, as expressed by "valued aesthetically" and "beautiful" in the dictionary definitions and the reference to story-telling that adds value, in the restorer's definition, and the choice of words such as "gentle" and "true" in the American antiques dealer's description. Condition reports in auction houses tend to emulate the style of museum condition reports, which aim to be objective and devoid of subjective opinions and vivid descriptions. In an interview with a middle manager at a major Swedish auction house, I learnt that the term patina is not used by the specialists of the auction house when cataloguing and writing condition reports about objects, since it is regarded as too sweeping a characterisation.

In an academic context, research on patina relevant for this article has been conducted by a number of anthropologists (McCracken 1988, Miller 2009, Dawdy 2016). Grant McCracken (1988) explains the workings of the patina system of consumption and how it conveyed status from medieval times until the fashion system replaced it in the 18th century when the consumer society evolved. Before the 18th century, possessions of families of high standing were handed down to new generations and in the process these objects became worn, chipped and dented. Their transformation was physical, but above all patina served as a symbolic asset, legitimising the status of the family. In the new consumer society, the pace of fashion accelerated and new objects were valued higher than old, inherited object. "With novelty in the ascendent, patina fell into eclipse" (McCracken 1988: 32). In the modern world, patina still exists, but leads a more obscure life, used only by the nouveaux riches who buy objects with patina to assert their status. McCracken concludes: "For the mass of society, the notion of patina is hopelessly antique, a charming notion that has passed from fashion" (McCracken 1988: 43). Consumer society has changed since the 1980s, and one could argue that through second-hand culture, patina is on the rise again.

Daniel Miller (2009) approaches the subject of patina by comparing the business of distressed jeans with the market of second-hand goods. The jeans have never been worn by a person but have gone through an industrial process to look worn and to acquire a patina. The junk and antiques that one can find in flea-markets and other informal outlets, on the other hand, have been used and worn by real people. While the jeans are primarily consumed by young people and the flea markets are frequented by the older generation, Miller regards both cases as a way of buying time, as "a trade in patina" (Miller 2009: 142). The important thing is not that we ourselves have used these things, but that we, in these different ways, take part in the circulation of generic lives (Miller 2009).

Patina as a concept can also be applied to a whole city, as Shannon Lee Dawdy (2016) does when discussing the effect of the Hurricane Katrina on the city of New Orleans in 2005. The reconstruction of the city has given rise to questions of authenticity and how to manage the cultural heritage and the patina for which New Orleans is famous. The city has a strong grip on the past, that few other American cities can rival. In addition to bigger urban structures, Dawdy pays attention to the great interest for antiques shared by many citizens of New Orleans. She has interviewed people who lost their houses in the hurricane, and they point out heirlooms as the objects they miss the most. Such heirlooms are often regarded by their owners as worthless from a financial point of view, and they seldom enter commercial circulation. There is also a flourishing antiques market in the city, where collectors are hunting for rare items and tourists are buying souvenirs. Dawdy argues that "patina does two important things. It critiques the present in general and capitalism in particular, by creating a heterotopia of an 'other time'. And it helps bind people together by providing an everyday sign of fictive ancestry and collective affect – a profane kind of mana" (Dawdy 2016: 18).

Judging from the findings of these three anthropologists, patina is a malleable concept, which has taken on many different meanings in different times and contexts. It is at present not "hopelessly antique", rather positively antique, and can be used to define our relationship to the past and the passing of time as seen through material culture. Whereas Dawdy sees patina as critiquing the present and capitalism, it could also be argued that it is because the concept is nebulous and has too many positive connotations, that it is scarcely used by the experts in the auction trade, who want to inspire credibility and trustworthiness as experts in general, not just agents of the companies they represent. The *Antiques Roadshow* is an arena where they can perform this role.

The *Antiques Roadshow*

The British version of *Antiques Roadshow* was launched in 1979 and the format has since spread to several other countries. People are invited to bring their heirlooms or flea market finds to the show and have them evaluated by experts. Still, between 1500 and 4500 people are prepared to queue for the chance of participating in an episode (Atterbury & Allum 2017: 12). When the Swedish *Antikrundan* first aired in 1989 in cooperation with BBC, some episodes were filmed in Scandinavian cities, with British experts. In 1990, Swedish experts had been recruited. The program is still running and is one of the longest running programs of SVT (Sveriges Television). The format has stayed the same but some changes have occurred and the program has moved with the times. "The most important change has been a gradual shift away from antiquities and their values towards the owners and their stories" (Atterbury & Allum 2017: 15). In the opinion of Hugh Scully, one of the first British presenters, the most memorable feature of the program was the encounter with the owners, many of whom represented the eccentric British character (Atterbury & Allum 2017: 10). Both in the UK and in Sweden the experts have become popular TV-personalities. The book *Antikrundan: värdefulla råd och dyrköpta erfarenheter* (*The Antiques Roadshow: valuable advice and dearly-bought experiences*) (von Platen & Tull 2005) devotes one chapter to each expert, the chapter title consisting of the name of the expert and hers or his area of expertise.

The experts are not allowed to purchase or make any offers for the objects they appraise in the program. Nevertheless, the show has a symbiotic relationship with the market. This fact was highlighted by the owner of an online auction site, when I interviewed him. In his opinion, the program has been decisive for the antiques trade, by creating an interest in antiques. The experts are dealers, which influence their appraisals. By way of example: if a dealer has bought a bureau for 4000 kr and spent money on restoration, transport etc, he might sell it for 22 000 kr in his shop. That is the price, the owner of the online auction site explained, he then tells the owner, not 4000 kr, in order to be able to sell his bureau for the higher price.

Although the program has a strong commercial aspect, it is also a form of public education, teaching cultural history through objects (Janson 2000). The Swedish program is now mixing appraisals with short features with information about periods, artisans and artists. The program conveys standards of condition, how to care for antiques, how to detect forgeries, in sum, it educates consumers to become more discerning antiques buyers and owners.

The surface and the object beneath it

In his essay "Surface visions", Tim Ingold proposes that we should pay attention to the mundane surfaces that we encounter in everyday life, for instance water, stone, cloth, skin and paper, and also the gestures we use to treat these surfaces: "washing, scrubbing, brushing, sweeping, raking, shaving, ironing, mowing, polishing, scraping, grinding, and much more. These are operations that turn rough into smooth, dull into shiny, opaque into transparent, written scrawl into blank slate" (2017: 100). I think this is an eloquent way of describing the process of patina.

Patina is often, in the examples of definitions in the previous section and elsewhere, referred to as a surface phenomenon. One of the experts in the Swedish *Antiques Roadshow* says he is attracted by furniture that have retained the original paint, but that it is not about the paint, but the surfaces. "It is the traces after 200 years of use that form a link to history" (Janson 2000: 49). He thinks that the connection to the past is cut off if a piece of furniture is re-painted or the paint is removed. The restorers of the best preserved 18th century theatre in the world, Drottningholm Palace Theatre in Stockholm, have a similar view:

> When you enter this time capsule there is a smell of the 18th century. It is quite worn and there is a patina that we try to take care of which is very Swedish. In other countries, the form is valued, but here we value the worn surface as well, the slowed down ageing process. Especially the 18th century we treat with utter care, which means that we try to preserve the upper layer. (Volpe 2010: 32)

Is patina part of the object or separate from it? Can the object be seen as intact under the surface? Furniture can have a sanded, painted or gilded finish, and the smoothness of the finish is an important aspect when assessing the quality of a piece of furniture. Finish can be seen as a cover that encloses an object and makes it into a perfect whole. Patina punctures this perfection of the object – wear and crackles make the object vulnerable and give us a glimpse beneath the surface. If when the object was brand new, we focussed on the surface, patina becomes the double focus lens that allows us to focus both on the surface and the core of the object. Depending on the object, the core can have different compositions, it can consist of one massive material like wood or metal, or it can be made up of a structure with several different materials connected through that structure. In 3D computer graphics, which constitute the visual environment in most computer games, objects are constructed as shapes made up of polygons, and then different textures can be mapped onto the shapes. In the physical world, there is no sharp line between surface and core, it is a continuum. Nevertheless, for the sake of clarity, the surface – core relationship will be a useful conceptual tool in the analyses.

Figure 1. Conversation about sundial from the Swedish *Antiques Roadshow* © SVT Antikrundan.

The sundial with the missing stick

In one of the episodes of the Swedish *Antiques roadshow* (season 29, episode 1, 2018), a visitor had brought with her an old cast iron sundial that had lost its stick. The format of the sundial was square, and the year 1688 appeared on the face along with the initials KGS, which stands for the nobleman Karl Gustav Sparre. The expert asks the visitor what she knows about the object, and as she seems to be quite knowledgeable about it, he wonders why she came to the show.

> V: Well, because I would like to know how to renovate it. (laughs a little)
>
> E: Are you going to renovate it!! (exclaims, surprised and upset)
>
> V: No, but I have to have a stick there for otherwise I can't see the time, can I? (points to the middle of the sundial)
>
> E: Okay, I'm getting really worried. You'll be renovating it, and if we start by confirming that this is an original, it's made in 1688, so everything is correct and I think it's a wonderful sundial. 18th century sundials, we get them at every location in the *Antiques Roadshow*, they are even quite common.
>
> V: Okay
>
> E: But when you step back into the 17th century, it's the period when Sweden was a great power, during the baroque, really. I think it's wonderful just as it is and you might think it's rusty, and so on. There is only one thing you are allowed to do, you can take linseed oil and gently grease it, to prevent further oxidation, I really don't want you to do anything else. You must not *blast*, *paint or do anything else* (lectures with emphasis, raises his voice in the last sentence).
>
> V: But what about the stick then?
>
> E: Then it's ruined!! (says emphatically, raises his voice)
>
> V: The stick? (says questioningly)
>
> E: Destroyed!! (makes gesture with his hand)

V: (Laughs a little startled)

E: Let it be!

V: Yes, but I can't tell the time.

E: Get yourself a clock. (gesticulates with his arms) I think it's wonderful, you have the whole story and it's in a great condition, it's not cracked or anything, I think the condition is good.

V: Okay

E: I want you to think that the condition is good. (takes a step towards her)

V: (laughs)

E: But you didn't buy it, did you?

V: No, I found it, I was going to clean an outhouse, and it just stood there, it just came with the farm when I bought it.

E: Fantastic. Value, provided you don't destroy it. (says sternly and encouragingly) What kind of money are we talking about, do you think?

V: No idea, I think….

E: It is after all the period when Sweden was a great power.

V; Yes, but I don't think….

E: Now the Caroline collectors emerge, they sort of like the baroque thing.

V: No, I don't have a clue.

E: I believe that if we find a number of collectors, the market value would probably be about 15 000 kr (£1200).

> V: Okay! I wouldn't have guessed that. Fantastic find. The farm became less expensive in this way. (laughs)
>
> E: Just pay off the mortgage. (laughs)

The price is probably not the reason why this object was selected for inclusion in the final show. 'We pay great attention to the owner's reactions during the conversations and the moment when the price of the object is revealed', says the producer of the Swedish show (Janson 2000: 41). What makes this conversation interesting is the tension between the expert and the visitor, created by a different notion on the general value of the object in question. The visitor regards the object as a clock, a utility object that can be used to tell the time, and she expects to get some advice about how to make it function again. The expert sees a rare object that has once been a utility object but is now valuable foremost as a trace from the past. His mission is to prevent her from doing any harm to this historic object and to instil in her the correct perception of patina. The expert and the visitor are not on the same wavelength, and the little controversy that ensues creates tension and excitement, which is of value for the show.

It is the expert who has the upper hand in this attempt of persuasion, since he is the authority on antiques, but the visitor does not yield voluntarily. She raises objections and brings the stick repeatedly into the conversation, and she looks incredulous and not entirely convinced when the expert fastens his eyes on her and tells her to get a modern clock if she wants to know the time. He makes big gestures and he transgresses her personal space to emphasise his standpoint. He uses modal verbs of obligation and prohibition, such as must, and he also asserts his authority by telling her what she thinks, that the object is rusty and in a bad condition. The expert plays both roles in order to persuade the visitor that her point of view is wrong, and points out the advantages of the object's current, patinated condition. We do not need this object to tell the time, other more modern contraptions have been invented since the late 17^{th} century. What we need is an old, patinated object that remind us of our history. The stick is not an indispensable feature of the sundial in order for it to serve that purpose. If the sundial would be restored and fitted with a new stick, it would be altered in a way that severs the connection to the past. The behaviour of the expert can seem a little harsh, but he has to persuade not only the owner of the sundial, but the whole audience watching the show on TV. The conversation has a persuasive purpose and enacts a common trope in the show: the expert who saves the object from its owner's neglect and ignorance.

An iron tablet is a massive object with no structural difference between the surface and the core. However, oxidation can make the whole object vanish if rust is let to eat away layer after layer of the tablet. The only measures the owner is allowed to take is to grease it with oil, in order to stop the decay. This is somewhat paradoxical – patina is desirable, but only to a certain extent. The process should not be allowed to continue, because then there is a risk that it will ruin the object. The tension between the expert and the visitor described above can be construed in terms of functionality and patina. The visitor is focused on the functionality of the timepiece, whereas the expert assumes that she is deterred by the rusty, patinated surface. If he had been able to put himself in her shoes, it would have been easier for him to win her over for his cause.

Fig 2. Conversation about toy car from the British *Antiques Roadshow* © BBC One Antiques roadshow.

The play-worn toy car

A different approach is taken in this conversation from the BBC *Antiques Roadshow* (series 39, New Lanark 1, 2017) about the toy car P2 Alpha.

> E: This is such a great toy car. It's big, it's bold, it's beautifully decorated, it's a snazzy colour. Why have you got it?
>
> V: Oh, my husband got it as a gift from his grandmother when he was on holiday, and he would have been about seven, so about forty-three years ago and she bought it at a jumble sale, they were at the beach, she

went off to a jumble sale and came back with the car for him. He was quite delighted with it!

E: I bet he was, presumably just bought for a few pence!

V: Yeah, it was I think 10p, 20p, something like that, certainly not anything. It was a jumble sale in Millport, so… Nothing would have gone for a lot of money there.

E: Presumably, it had been played with and was in poor condition when he got it?

V: Well, no, no it wasn't. He got it and he played with it, he had his action men in it and it was up and down the street and he had a lot of fun with it.

E: I suppose, an object can only give once, yeah.

V: Yeah

E: And it's already given, and it's given a lot of pleasure to your husband. But to me, almost, it's too good to be a toy. For lots of reasons, let's just have a look at how beautifully made it is. First of all, it's modelled on a real car.

V: Yeah

E: It's modelled on an Alpha Romeo racing car called a P2, so it's known as the P2 Alpha. And just look at the detail. First of all, the filler caps, just below the cockpit and on the radiator, the radiator grille, the tyres, they're proper cars' tyres, they say Michelin on them. And the exhaust, the hand break, the actual, proper, usable steering wheel. So, in every way it looks like the real car, apart from back here, where of cause, you've got the arbor to wind up the clock work, not seen on the full-size vehicle. (laugh) It was made in France, by company Compagnie Industrielle du Jouet (CIJ), and the P2 Alpha was *the* car at the moment, in 1925 it won an important race, and it was *the* formula 1 car of its time, so that's why the company produced them, it was riding a wave of popularity, and they produced a whole range of these in different colours, so there was silver and white and red and blue, *and*, the orange one is an unusual one.

V: Oh

E: So, let's think about the little boy that would have owned this in the 1920s, he would have been from a good family, he would have probably heard about this fabulous race where the P2 Alpha had won, and he would have got this at Christmas and would have been completely over the moon. So, your husband, eh, had a lot of fun with it, and has it been passed down through the family or?

V: Oh yeah, now it sits on a ledge in my son's room, so he enjoys it, thinks it looks quite cool, so (laughs).

E: Cool it does look. What's it worth?

V: I don't know.

E: I would have said, year after year after year, these were fetching £2000, which is a lot of money for a toy car, and I was very excited whenever I saw one of these. As a result, something very strange happened this year, and one sold for £12000, so that has now made me completely rethink the value of this. I mean, admittedly the one that was sold earlier in the year was in perfect condition, original condition, this isn't, but actually, I like the fact that it has been play-worn, it doesn't worry me at all, and it won't worry some types of collectors. So, I think that I'm going to have to look at that £12000-price and look at the regular price, and put it somewhere in the middle, so I would say that your car today would be worth between £4000 and £6000.

V: Oh dear, well I never expected that, not at all. (laughs surprised)

E: And is your son still going to have it?

V: Yeah, I think so.

E: Lucky son! Well, thank you very much indeed for bringing it in, it's been a real treat.

V: Thank you, thank you very much. I'll get it back in the bag. (laughter from audience)

The interaction between expert and visitor in this conversation is built on cooperation rather than tension. Both contribute to spinning the story of the old toy in its different life phases and transactions, which is a salient feature of the show (Walker 2012: 23) However, the expert has the initiative and is the driving force in the conversation. She gives the visitor general information about the car and when, where and why it was produced, and underlines her statements with big gestures directed at the car. The visitor listens attentively, and uses back-channel signals like nods and giggles, in response to what the expert says. For her part, the visitor possesses crucial information about this specific car and can contradict the expert's assumption that it was in poor condition when her husband got it, and she assures the expert that he played with it outdoors and had a lot of fun with it. The present condition of the car is presumably the result of at least two children's play, the first and the second owner of the car. The term the expert uses is 'play-worn', which indicates an agreeable form of wear, with positive connotations of childhood, in which the viewers and experts alike can indulge.

The expert praises the car and its qualities and elevates it to a 'serious' artefact by stating 'But to me, almost, it's too good to be a toy.' When it is time for the appraisal, the expert conducts a line of argument that indicates that there is a change in the attitude towards patina in the antiques market and that the worn condition is now more highly valued than before. The expert gives details about the price trend in toy cars and how a car of the same type was sold for a much higher price than usual. That car was in a pristine condition, but she says: 'I like the fact that it has been play-worn, doesn't worry me at all, and it won't worry some types of collectors.' The reason given for the increased price level is thus the preference of the collectors, not some external factor on the market. However, she is a little cautious, shown by her use of the word 'worry' twice in the sentence above. The idiom 'don't worry' is frequently used to reassure people that everything is alright, but nevertheless it suggests that there might be something to worry about.

Patina resides on the surface of the toy, but ageing does not seem to have affected the core of the car. Were it not for its newly assigned monetary value, it would be fit for more play. Unlike the sundial in the previous example, it does not lack any vital part of its structure and still has the potential to fulfil its original purpose. In this case, there do not seem to be a conflict between patina and function. It is also not as old and rare as the sundial, it is an industrially manufactured 20th century object, and many similar copies might still exist, although this colour is unusual. The process of patina can be allowed to continue, it does not have to be stopped at this exact moment in time.

The reasoning of this expert is in line with other actors in the antiques trade. Alessandro Pergoli Campanelli, researcher in heritage conservation, published a short piece on the value of patina in *News in Conservation*, a newsletter from the International Institute for Conservation of Historic and Artistic Work. He claims that there is a change in the perception of patina in the market, and puts forward the example of vintage wristwatches: the ones with an original, worn dial have become more valuable than watches with a reprinted dial (Pergoli Campanelli 2012). Other experts share this view, for instance Eric Wind, one of Christie's watch experts, who in the piece "Aged to perfection — The patina trend in watches" states that "This trend towards seeking honest patina has extended worldwide, particularly over the last five years" (Wind 2017).

Vintage watches and the tooth of time

This example is part of the auction house Christie's website, a collection guide where Christie's experts give advice to collectors and buyers, published 27 February 2015. The title is *Ask a Specialist: Value vs. Condition.* The preamble reads "Don't polish that case! Christie's Watch Specialists on why it's best to keep your watch all original" (Christie's 2015).

Unlike the previous two examples, this is not an oral dialogue between two individuals. The text has the narrative form of Questions and Answers, which is frequent on websites. No names are mentioned, the question is preceded by "Q:"and the answer by "A:". The text contains frequent references to watches sold by Christie's and also three images of Rolex watches, two of which are examples of how patina can enhance the value of a watch.

The opening question is 'When is a little wear and tear too much? Is it ever a good thing?' and the rest of the text is a long answer that covers different aspects of this question. The unused, unworn watches in pristine condition are still the most valuable, but a change towards higher appreciation of patina is underway. From the outset it is clear that the aim is to convince the inexperienced collector, who might avoid worn objects, to realise the value of watches with patina. The structure of the text is based on the parts of a watch, such as bezel, dial, case, crystal, bracelet and movement. We get to know that bezels made of the brittle material bakelite in the 1950s and 1960s are rare and have been replaced in most watches of the time, which is why original bezels are valuable even if they are faded or cracked. Dials that are faded in the right way are also sought after.

> The hottest word in vintage watch collecting right now is "tropical," which essentially means something has faded because of the sunlight. The paint on the dials, for example, can fade. That does create more

> value in many collectors' eyes. And it also shows use, which gives a watch a story. It hasn't just been sitting on the shelf. That's particularly appealing with vintage Rolex sport watches which could have been used anywhere from a racetrack to a mountaintop to a deep sea military excursion. (Christie's 2015)

The attraction is reduced if the fading is uneven. What collectors are looking for are watches with "consistent patina". Some collectors like the effect of cracked lacquer, but it depends on their personal taste. When cases are concerned, they should not be polished. In 2011, Christie's sold a rare watch that was nearly black by oxidation, which was a sign the watch was virtually unused, and it went for a high price. A badly scratched crystal may be replaced as may the bracelet, as long as it is one from the same manufacturer. Finally, the movement of the watch should be in good condition. Function is essential, as expressed by the statement "The watch should work" (Christie's 2015).

This text is characterised by vivid description of the watches and their different parts, especially the surfaces. The accounts of the watches sold by the auction house are rendered in an anecdotal and conversational tone, to make the reader feel she is listening to the advice of an expert in person. To create the illusion of dialogue, fictive quotes from collectors are inserted, for instance "It might make a collector say 'I don't want anything to do with it.'" (Christie's 2015) Advice is given, but not with absolute certainty. Modal verbs like might, can, and modal adverbs like sometimes, often, are used throughout the text, and phrases like "But again, there's a balancing act" indicate that the discourse on value is an ongoing negotiation and the criteria are subject to change.

The surface – core relationship is more intricate in the case of watches than in the previous two examples. There are several surfaces that have to be reckoned with and the core of a watch is made up of a complicated mechanical clockwork. Full functionality is a prerequisite, and a fine patina cannot compensate for a deficient measuring of time. The case can be opened and the clockwork inspected, but under normal conditions, the core of the object is hidden from view and should be protected by the outer parts of the watch.

How different attitudes to patina are conveyed

Taken together, what do these three examples tell us about the notions of patina? For the antiques programming, the dynamics between different norms and valuation of condition of objects can be seen as a benefit, as it adds drama to shows like the *Antiques Roadshow*. For auction houses, a higher valuation of worn objects entails an opportunity to expand the market and for collectors it means a challenge to their prevailing taste and preferences.

The experts use different persuasive strategies to convey their norms regarding the condition of objects to their clients and audience. The strategies all build on references to the collectors and their tastes. In the case of the sundial, the expert says “Now the Caroline collectors emerge, they sort of like the baroque thing”, as a hint to the visitor about the price. The toy expert assures that the play-worn condition “won’t worry some types of collectors” and the watch experts frequently refer to the taste of collectors in their advice. The most common persuasive strategy is reference to sales prices at auctions where similar items have gone under the hammer. The toy expert is the only one who explicitly brings up a shift to a higher price level for toy cars with patina, which surprised her, and which is why she dares estimate this particular car at a higher price than she would have before.

The role of the expert is close to that of a teacher, and therefore it would be relevant to talk about didactic styles when analysing how the experts convey their norms of the condition to their clients and audience. The sundial expert applies a stern, schoolmasterly style when talking to the visitor. He states how it is and expects her to obey his advice regarding the care of the object. The toy expert uses a gentler tone, and conducts a line of argument about recent auctions sales in order to convince the visitor. The watch experts have the smoothest didactic style, probably because they want to keep the door open to all sorts of clients. Even though they stress the value of watches with patina, they bring up several cases and take pros and cons into consideration.

Use and usefulness

Usefulness must be seen in relation to age. The sundial is too old to be expected to have any use value, and should not be restored. It is seen by the expert from a conservation perspective, where the goal is to keep it from further deterioration and where only minimal intervention is recommended (Hölling 2017, Jones & Yarrow 2013). Different principles apply to newer utility goods, that should be fit for use, according to both the manager at the auction house and the owner of the online auction site that I interviewed. “To customers who ask if they can repaint a 20th century kitchen table, I would say, go ahead” said the manager. She thinks that simple objects are utility goods and should be used in a home. However, one should not repaint the bronzing of an antique mirror. The owner of the online auction site stated that “If I buy a chair, I want to be able to sit on it, if I buy a cast-iron bowl, I will use it for keeping my keys”. The extra wear that will be result does not affect the monetary value of the objects. I perceived in the interviews a certain resistance to the reverence of the “original condition”, that *Antiques roadshow* have fostered. What is relevant for older and rare antiques are not necessarily applicable to modern antiques and vintage goods.

Walker points out that we would not by a million-dollar card table in order to organise a poker night with friends, even if the table would still be fully functional. Such use could affect its value. “Rare and highly collectible items are not bought to be used, especially if use would somehow alter their condition. Action figures still in their original packaging are highly collectible and fetch high prices on the market, but as toys, they are completely useless” (2012: 21). However, there are different forms of use, and Walker adds that a collectible is “put into symbolic use every time its owner gloats over it or admires its beauty” (2012: 22). This means that the action figure in its pristine condition is still being used, but not in the same way as the toy car, that had been out on the streets and played with. Worn toys carry positive connotations to childhood and the freedom of being immersed in play. Aged and used Rolex sport watches carry connotations to adventure, masculinity, and advanced technology. Both objects tell a story through their patina. “If I wanted something that looked new, I would just go into a boutique and buy it. But I wanted something different; a watch that has been made unique by the ageing process” a young collector told a Christie’s watch expert (Wind 2017).

Humans in the material world

The watches in Christie’s collection guide provide a complex case of patination, in that they have been in close contact with human skin, sitting on the arm, as well as undergone a chemical process that man cannot influence. A watch is made up of several surfaces, some exposed to human touch and others, like the dial, that is enclosed and out of reach for human touch. Sunlight can fade the dial and create a “tropical” effect. Defect lacquer can result in cracks looking like spider web. Humans do not control these processes, but human connoisseurs decide whether the kind of patina is advantageous or not (Christie’s 2015, Omega forums 2017).

The sundial has undergone a natural chemical process of oxidation, due to age and exposure to the elements. It is not human touch, not the gestures that Ingold mentions in his essay “Surface visions”, that have altered the metal surface. In his discussion article “Materials against materiality”, he examines some attempts made by researchers to overcome the mind – matter polarity, and ascribes their lack of success to “the slippage from materials to materiality” (Ingold 2007: 7). Ingold advocates a focus on materials instead of on materiality, a term he thinks has contributed to skewing the discourse on material culture and further distanced us from materials. Humans are part of the material world and the human body is made up of materials like blood, skin and bone. “Like all other creatures, human beings do not exist on the ‘other side’ of materiality but swim in an ocean of materials” (Ingold 2007: 7).

Maybe objects with patina are popular because we feel an affinity with them. Using concepts like “the social life of things” and “cultural biography” is a way of humanising things and bringing them closer to us. If a thing has a life trajectory, it will also involve ageing. In the literature on antiques, there is a tendency to draw an analogy between the ageing of human beings and artefacts. Writing on the condition of antiques, the philosopher and heritage scholar Leon Rosenstein states:

> As is the case in human physiology, there are two sources of an object’s deterioration. The first is genetic: the material breaks down and slowly decomposes, especially in the case of organic materials (cloth, wood, oil paint). The second source of deterioration is accidental (traumatic): damage is by external forces such as wear, stain, breakage, and erosion. (Rosenstein 2009: 165)

“Organic materials” can refer to both humans and artefacts, and damage, if happening to a human, is not only accidental, but also traumatic. In a book on how to decorate with vintage finds, an analogy is drawn between the imperfect object and the imperfect human being:

> Old things carry histories, they last long and they smarten up all that light and fresh that we think we have to live among. Besides, the chafed and odd things are more forgiving. They make us justice, show us that also the worn is okay. No man is perfect. No man is made in an assembly line according to a check-list. We carry with us our background, that betray who we are with the help of scratches, scars and personality. In the same way, your home does not need to be perfect. It is a mirror of you, who you are and how you like to live your life. (Billgren 2014: 92)

Here we find patina as metaphor for human imperfection and as a means for taking a stance against the prevailing norms for appearance. According to the writer, these things create a friendly environment and allow us to feel at home with flaws and all. Patina is thus not a one-way process, where we give objects patina while using them, but objects can also influence us and the way we see ourselves.

Conclusion

What I have shown in this article is how vital the discourse of patina is for the antiques trade. A TV show like *Antiques Roadshow* is an ideal arena for the dissemination of notions of condition and patina. The expert in the sundial example tells the visitor with emphasis: “I want you to think that the condition is *good*”. By such statements, experts influence not only visitors and audience, but the whole antiques market. The way patina is perceived in the antiques trade vary over time, depending on the age and category of the object. Different attitudes can co-exist, as long as there is a demand from collectors.

Before the 18th century, when the patina system still ruled, patina gave status to a certain family through the passing down of heirlooms (McCracken 1988). Commodities sold at flea-markets can be characterised as tokens of a generic past, because they are circulated so frequently that they lose their connection to the original owner (Miller 2009). Reuse in a circular economy means passing things on to somebody else, but not necessarily to another family member. The toy car is a case in point.

According to McCracken, patina had to cede as a status marker to the fashion system in modern consumer society (1988). Since the 1980s, the pace of fashion and consumption in general has accelerated. Instead of trying to keep up with this pace, buying antiques and second-hand goods can be a way of slowing it down. Owning and using utility goods with a patina can be seen as a critique of an unsustainable consumption of brand-new things that have required new resources to be produced.

Apart from the rise of sustainable consumption as an explanation of the popularity of things with patina, another factor can be brought forward. We see antiques and other second-hand objects as mirrors of ourselves, and by surrounding ourselves with such objects, we find a way of reconciling ourselves with our own ageing process, and realise that the valuation of old age is not static. In circulation, second-hand objects move up and down along the hierarchy. What is today regarded as a shabby piece of junk may tomorrow become elevated to an antique with fine patina.

Karin Wagner is a professor in Art History and Visual Studies at the Department of Cultural Sciences at the University of Gothenburg, Sweden. Her research interests within visual and material culture include photography, new media, and visual communication. A recent article is "Nostalgic photographs in the contemporary image ecology: the example of Tyrrells crisp packaging", J*ournal of Aesthetics & Culture*, 2018, 10 (1). E-mail: karin.wagner@gu.se

Notes

[1]This and the following quotes from Swedish texts are my translations.

References

Antiques Roadshow (2017): TV show, series 39, New Lanark 1, BBC.
Antiques Roadshow (2018): TV show, season 29, episode 1, SVT.
Appadurai, Arjun (1986): *The social life of things: commodities in cultural perspective*, Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press.
Appelgren, Staffan & Anna Bohlin (2015): 'Growing in Motion: The Circulation of Used Things on Second-hand Markets, *Culture Unbound: Journal of Current Cultural Research*, 7(1):143–168.
Atterbury, Paul & Marc Allum (2017): *Antiques roadshow – 40 years of great finds*, London: HarperCollins Publishers.
Baker, Sarah Elsie (2012): 'Retailing retro: Class, cultural capital and the material practices of the (re)valuation of style', *European Journal of Cultural Studies,* 15:5, 621– 641.
Balthazar, Ana Carolina (2016): 'Old things with character: The fetishization of objects in Margate, UK', *Journal of Material Culture*, 21:4, 448–464.
Billgren, Elsa (2014): *Inred med vintage* (Decorate with vintage), Stockholm: Bonnier fakta.
Cherrier, Hélène (2010): 'Custodian behavior: A material expression of anti-consumerism', *Consumption, Markets and Culture*, 13:3, 259–272.
Christie's (2015): Ask a Specialist: Value vs. Condition, https://www.christies.com/features/Vintage-Watch-Original-Replacement-Damage-Ask-A-Specialist-5722-1.aspx (accessed 1 August 2018).
Dawdy, Shannon Lee (2016): *Patina: A profane archaeology*, Chicago; London: The University of Chicago Press.
Gaffney, Dennis (2008): What "Patina" Really Means, http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/roadshow/fts/lasvegas_200706A35.html (accessed 27 June 2018).
Gregson, Nicky & Louise Crewe (2003): *Second-Hand Cultures*, Oxford: Berg.
Hölling, Hanna (2017): 'The technique of conservation: on realms of theory and cultures of practice', *Journal of the Institute of Conservation*, 40:2, 87–96.
Ingold, Tim (2007): 'Materials against materiality', *Archaeological Dialogues*, 14:1, 1–16.
Ingold, Tim (2017): 'Surface Visions', *Theory, Culture & Society*, 34:7-8, 99–108.
Janson, Bengt (2000): *Antikrundan: programmet, experterna, föremålen* (The Antiques Roadshow: The Program, the Experts, the Artefacts), Stockholm: Prisma.
Jones, Siân & Thomas Yarrow (2013): 'Crafting authenticity: An ethnography of conservation practice', *Journal of Material Culture*, 18:1, 3–26.
Kopytoff, Igor (1986): 'The Cultural Biography of Things: Commoditization as Process', Arjun Appadurai (ed): *The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
Machin, David & Andrea Mayr (2012): *How to do critical discourse analysis: a multimodal introduction*, London: Sage.
McCracken, Grant (1988): *Culture and Consumption: New Approaches to the Symbolic Character of Consumer Goods and Activities*, Bloomington, Ind.: Indiana Univ. Press.
Miller, Daniel (2009): 'Buying time', Elizabeth Shove, Frank Trentmann & Richard Wilk (eds): *Time, Consumption and Everyday Life: Practice, Materiality and Culture,* Oxford: Berg, 157–170.
Omega forums (2017): Tropical 2998-2, https://omegaforums.net/threads/tropical-2998-2.56494/ (accessed 1 August 2018).
Pergoli Campanelli, Alessandro (2012): 'The value of patina on the antiques market – Affinities and relationships between conservation theories and buyers' taste', *News in Conservation,* 31, 8–9.
Rahn's Furniture Restoration (2015): 'Patina – A Sign of Wear or a Sign of Value?' 4 December, http://rahnsfurniturerestoration.com/2015/12/04/patina-a-sign-of-

wear-or-a-sign-of-value/ (accessed 27 June 2018).
Rosenstein, Leon (2009): *Antiques: The History of an Idea.* Ithaca & London: Cornell University Press.
Volpe, Erika (2010): 'Tillbaka till 1700-talet' (Back to the 18th century), *Kulturvärden* 4, 28–35.
von Platen, Joachim & Göran Tull (eds) (2005): *Antikrundan: värdefulla råd och dyrköpta erfarenheter* (The Antiques Roadshow: valuable advice and dearly-bought experiences), Stockholm: B. Wahlström.
Walker, Katherine (2012): 'The masterpiece in my attic: The changing role of antiques', Bob Batchelor (ed): *Cult Pop Culture: How the Fringe Became Mainstream*: *Volume 3: Everyday Cult*, New York: Praeger, 17–28.
Wind, Eric (2017): Aged to perfection — The patina trend in watches, https://www.christies.com/features/The-patina-trend-in-watches-8023-1.aspx (accessed 27 June 2018).

Culture Unbound
Journal of Current Cultural Research

Paradoxes of Mentoring
An Ethnographic Study of a Mentoring Programme for Highly-educated Women with Migrant Backgrounds

By Tytti Steel, Anna-Maija Lämsä & Marjut Jyrkinen

Abstract

This article explores paradoxes that emerge in the mentoring of highly-educated, female, foreign-born job-seekers in Finland. Theoretically, the study is linked to the growing body of research scrutinising the integration or discrimination of migrants in working life. It analyses cultural practices and ideas that are visible and affect the mentoring interaction. On a more practical level, the paper determines how the mentors and mentees experience the mentoring, and how intercultural mentoring could be improved in order to promote mentees' employment. The article is based on ethnography and 11 semi-structured interviews.

Two major paradoxes and their links to cultural meanings were identified: the over-emphasised focus on Finnish language (the language paradox), and the myth of the strong Finnish woman (the support paradox). These can be seen as having aspects of both cultural awareness and situation-specific awareness. Using situation-specific awareness, some mentors understood the best way forward was to break the rules of the mentoring programme and not to use Finnish in all communication. This enabled a more equal setting for professional discussions. In some rare cases, when the mentors did not use situation-specific awareness, a vicious circle emerged and mentees felt even worse about their abilities and working life opportunities. Similarly, although the myth of the strong Finnish woman can be an empowering and positive model for the mentee, it can have a negative impact on the mentor, enabling undercurrents in the mentoring discussions which can be experienced as harsh and even hostile. This, instead of encouraging and supporting, can result in the undermining and 'othering' of the mentee.

Keywords: ethnography, intercultural, mentoring, migrant women, paradox

Steel, Tytti, Anna-Maija Lämsä and Marjut Jyrkinen "Paradoxes of Mentoring: An Ethnographic Study of a Menotring Programme for Highly-educated Women with Migrant Backgrounds", *Culture Unbound*, Volume 11, issue 2, 2019: 275–297. Published by Linköping University Electronic Press: http://www.cultureunbound.ep.liu.se

Introduction

The aim of this article is to explore paradoxes that emerge in the mentoring of highly-educated, female, foreign-born job-seekers in Finland. We are interested in how the mentors and mentees experience mentoring, and how intercultural mentoring could be improved in order to promote mentees' employment. The employment rate of migrants is usually lower than that of native people in Europe and North America (Petrovic 2015). In Finland, the employment rate of foreign-born women is approximately 56%, thereby lower than the average employment rate of 69%, the employment rate of foreign-born men (71.2%), or that of women with a Finnish background (73.5%) (Nieminen et al. 2015). The language skills needed in the new home country, 'foreign' qualifications, a lack of local work experience and social networks are all hindrances for foreign-born job-seekers (Ahmad 2005, Jaakkola & Reuter 2007, Povrzanović Frykman 2012, Tarnanen & Pöyhönen 2011, Wolanik Boström & Öhlander 2011). In addition to the challenges of learning a new language and updating one's qualifications, prejudice, xenophobia and discrimination are also encountered in the labour market (e.g. Aalto, Larja & Liebkind 2010). In the European context, immigrants who have obtained their higher education, skills and credentials abroad have been identified as a particularly vulnerable group in the labour market (Kyhä 2006, Petrovic 2015, Tuori 2009:43).

Previous research has indicated a lack of studies dealing specifically with the manner in which culture influences mentoring programmes and relationships (Kent et al. 2013). Theoretically, our study is linked to the growing body of research scrutinising the integration of or discrimination against migrants in working life. Often the emphasis has been on what foreign-born people should do differently in order to integrate (Tuori 2009). Recent reports have indicated that Finnish society has failed to improve the inclusion of its new citizens, as their employment rates are relatively low and racism is widespread (European Agency for Fundamental Rights 2018, OECD 2018). Previous research has indicated that in Finland there is a very strong link between language, nationality and identity, although the homogeneity of Finns is often exaggerated (e.g. Elmgren 2016, Knuuttila 1996). Highly skilled migrants perceive Finns as being a closed, homogenous group that values security, tradition and the status quo (Koskela 2013). This idea is in line with what, for instance, Homi K. Bhabha (1994) has written about how culture is often understood as a homogenised unit with clear boundaries. Different cultural units are the basis for the production of cultural meanings, for instance 'othering' and hierarchies. In line with Bhabha, our epistemological understanding of culture is that differences in interaction or customs are true in everyday life, but that in essence, culture is hybrid and complex. From this stance, the term intercultural mentoring (Osula & Irvin 2009) can be criticised for highlighting differences instead of shared ambitions, qualities, and values linked to working life. Therefore, it is important to scrutinise mentoring as an interactive cultural practice without assuming that only the jobseeker or mentee has to adapt to the new socio-cultural context. Instead, in today's globalising work markets, organisations also need to be prepared to adapt to a diverse workforce, as typically assumed in the literature on mentoring (e.g. Casado-Lumbreras et al. 2011). At the same time, our understanding of mentoring is that it is a constructive learning process (e.g. Cooper 1993) that highlights the active role of the mentee (see more in the Ethnography section). In addition, we should pay attention to the cultural meanings of the Finnish language as these can be central to the success of mentoring. In this frame, we will explore which cultural practices and ideas are visible and affect the mentoring interaction.

Mentoring has been targeted towards unemployed, foreign-born women on a larger scale in North America, but is now increasingly being targeted towards this group in Europe (Petrovic 2015). For example, in Germany, the non-profit organisation Beramí has been providing a mentoring network for highly qualified, foreign-born women since 2005. Approximately 18 mentoring dyads have been formed annually in the Beramí programme so far. In Denmark, immigrant and refugee women have been targeted by the KVINFO Mentor Network which aims to help migrant women by building their social and professional network. Since 2002, over 6000 women have participated in more than 3000 mentoring partnerships in this Danish programme (Petrovic 2015, KVINFO 2017). KVINFO has acted as the model for WOMENTO, a mentoring programme established in 2012 by the Family Federation of Finland. The results of the WOMENTO programme have been encouraging: in 2012–2014, 37% of the 60 mentees who took part in the programme found a job, 30% of whom obtained a job in the field of their own profession during the mentoring process (Family Federation of Finland 2017).

The mentoring programme studied in this article was based on the womento model, and its focus was on integration, improvement of language skills and enhancing employment among the mentees (Family Federation of Finland 2017). In the studied programme, the womento model (described in more detail in Kinnunen 2013) also accepted foreign-born women as mentors, whereas the original model only permitted women with a Finnish background to be mentors. The studied programme was organised by an anonymous non-governmental organisation (ngo) that provides several kinds of service to migrant women. Our research material consists of personal interviews, participant observations and the mentoring documents provided by the NGO. Both the mentees and the mentors in the observed programme were women. The aim of the interviews was to determine how the women perceived the programme and their own career prospects and opportunities, as well as to more extensively map out the views of the interviewees regarding Finnish working life.

In the preliminary analysis of the field notes and the interviews, some issues arose that we interpreted as paradoxical. We assessed their importance as high and assumed that applying a paradox framework (outlined by Schad et al. 2016) would be a fruitful way of scrutinising the sources. The framework, which has theoretical roots in philosophy and psychology, aims to provide a deeper understanding of the constructs, relationships, and dynamics surrounding organisational tensions. The paradox framework allows us to make visible the controversial nature of mentoring for foreign-born women, because, despite good intentions, formal mentoring programmes for these women may be embedded with paradoxes which, in addition to enabling, may also constrain their job-seeking opportunities. This combination is in line with the aims of a paradox frame that scrutinises complexities rather than 'either-or' results (Schad et al. 2016). We seek to answer the following research questions: What are the major paradoxes linked to a formal mentoring programme for foreign-born women? How are these paradoxes linked to the mentees' job-seeking capabilities?

Ethnography

After successful access negotiations, the ethnographic research process began at the beginning of 2016. We chose a combination of participant observation and semi-structured interviews as the method for this part of the larger research project. First-hand knowledge of the programme participants' perceptions of the mentoring was crucial, and we therefore conducted personal interviews. The participant observation had a two-fold function: on the one hand it was a preliminary investigation in order to determine what questions are relevant in this context. On the other hand, it was a method to gain an 'outsider's' view of the mentoring interaction and combine it with how the participants themselves presented mentoring in their interviews (see e.g. Fangen 2005: 188–189). Participant observation enabled us to obtain an overview of what was happening in the group meetings and gain insights that would not necessarily surface in the interviews. Moreover, we presumed from the beginning that for practical reasons, all the mentors and mentees could not be interviewed, and participant observation was a way in which to include as many participants as possible.

The first mentoring group we observed started in the autumn of 2015, with 11 mentors and 11 mentees. The second observed group began in the autumn of 2016, with 17 mentors and 17 mentees. The programme consisted of a kick-off meeting, a mid-evaluation and a final meeting. During the eight months of the mentoring process, the dyads also met according to their own schedules, and kept in touch via, for example, email or Messenger.

In addition to the three mentoring meetings of each group, monthly joint gatherings were open to all the participants. These meetings, all held in Finnish, consisted of workshops or presentations given by visitors on themes such as entrepreneurship and recruitment processes. In the kick-off meeting, the mentors and mentees listened to a presentation on the principles of mentoring and signed a mentoring contract. This was a simple paper in Finnish consisting of the mentor's and the mentee's contact details and space to describe the goal of the mentoring in one or two sentences. The introductory text of the form also emphasised that the mentor's task was not to find a job for the mentee. All the materials, for example the slides of the speakers, job adverts and other interesting information, were emailed to the participants after the meetings.

The ethnography began with discussions with the organising NGO's employees and the observations of three of the joint meetings of the mentoring group, the purpose of which was to get to know the field in order to specify the research interests as well as build trust with the participants to facilitate later finding interviewees. In one of the joint meetings, the researcher presented the WeAll Project (Social and Economic Sustainability of Future Working Life Consortium) as a whole, explaining the aim of finding mechanisms of inequality. In these first meetings, the researcher did not write a field diary, but made notes after the meetings.

After the first group finished in the spring of 2016, all the participants were invited to an interview. We conducted 11 personal interviews with the women who had taken part in the first group as mentees (5), mentors (5) or organisers (1). These took place in the spring of 2016 and were supplemented at the beginning of 2017. The interviews lasted about one hour and were audio recorded and later transcribed verbatim by a professional transcriber. When they were contacted, and before recording began, the interviewees were informed that good research ethic guidelines, including anonymity and confidentiality, would be followed throughout the research process (see the National Advisory Board on Research Ethics 2009).

We introduce the interviewees by presenting some basic knowledge about them in the list of references. The pseudonyms are popular women's names in English. The mentors' pseudonyms begin with the letter M and the mentees' names begin with the letter A, since the word *aktori*, 'actor' is used for mentee in Finnish language. 'Actor' highlights the expected active role of the mentee as the 'subject of the mentoring, the "apprentice or trainee", an active participant and the owner of the mentoring process' (Ahlfors et al. n.d., Kanniainen et al. 2017). Nevertheless, in the text we use the term mentee, as 'actor' in English already has several meanings.

All except one of the interviewed mentees were from different European countries, including western parts of Russia. Some of those who were from, for example, the Middle East, did not come forward to be interviewed. This could be due to the lack of a common language, because apart from Finnish, English was the only language offered in the interview invitation. The researchers did not define the level of education of the mentees: this was done by the NGO when the mentees were signed up for the programme. Three of the mentors had a Finnish background and two had a foreign, European background.

The interviews were semi-structured and included open-ended (Fägerborg 1999, Hennik et al. 2011) questions about the mentoring process and the mentoring programme, how the interviewee saw her future in Finnish working life, and what factors could hinder or help her in achieving her career goals. The themes were similar in both the mentees' and mentors' interviews. All the interviewees were asked to introduce themselves in their own words. We deliberately did not underline the interviewees' journey or reasons for coming to Finland, in order to keep the focus on working life.

Most of the interviews were conducted in Finnish. In the case of two mentees, the language was English, and in two other mentees' interviews, a mixture of languages was used. Many of the interviewees were very busy and the researchers were fortunate to be able to get an interview at all. The interviewer, a member of the research team, felt that even though the interviews were rather short, they were open and relaxed. Although they covered difficult issues, the atmosphere was positive, with joking and laughter.

The second mentoring group, which started in the autumn of 2016, was followed throughout its different phases. Our researcher took part in five meetings (of the seven in total), including the kick-off, the mid-evaluation and the final meeting in the spring of 2017. The researcher acted as a participant, except in the discussions of mentoring dyads in the first meeting. The form of ethnography used was active participation: the researcher sought to participate in many activities without being a mentor or a mentee herself (Hennik et al. 2011: 182). She presented the aims of the research in the kick-off meeting and the participants were given the option of declining to take part in the research. She explained that anonymity and confidentiality would be carefully adhered to throughout the project. The research team decided to also anonymise the NGO for the benefit of the participants.

Paradox as a framework for the analysis

In this study, we define a paradox as consisting of contradictory yet interrelated elements, which seem logical in isolation, but absurd and irrational when they appear simultaneously (Schad et al. 2016, Lewis 2000). Some researchers have emphasised the persistency of the contradiction between interdependent elements

(Schad et al. 2016). For us, the key characteristic of a paradox is the simultaneous presence of contradictory, even mutually exclusive elements (Cameron & Quinn 1988). For example, collaboration – competition tensions in organisations, or social mission – financial performance in social enterprises, have been identified as paradoxes (Schad et al. 2016).

In accordance with Quinn and Cameron (1988), we perceive a paradox as an ongoing process that reflects cyclical dynamics that can be either reinforcing or self-correcting (Sundaramurthy & Lewis 2003). We do not perceive paradoxes as positive or negative as such. Instead we try to tap into the possibilities that the identification of paradoxes offers. We hope that 'coping with' or even 'working through' paradoxes will help us find ways of improving the mentoring of foreign-born women (see Schad et al. 2016).

The analysis was conducted in three stages, and we applied the paradox meta-theory framework generated by Schad et al. (2016). First, we identified the paradoxes in the sources through closely reading the interviews and field notes. At this stage, we identified and categorised tensions and examined the interplay between interdependent contradictions. Second, we chose two thematic 'clusters' – paradoxes that we assessed as most significant for the mentees' job-seeking and career capabilities. We selected the paradoxes for closer analysis on the basis of previous research on the employment of foreign-born women, especially in Finland. At this stage, we elaborated the analysis by stressing collective approaches and individual responses: the individual actors' capabilities, cognition and emotional responses.

In the third stage of the analysis, we aimed to find practical solutions for developing the career mentoring of foreign-born women, specifically in the Finnish context. In the meta-theory framework, this third stage includes deepening the understanding of the outcomes and the impact of the paradox, including its dynamics and cyclical processes which can both enable and constrain. In practice, these stages of the analysis were intertwining and cyclical, as the exploratory analysis had already started with a preliminary study and was further accelerated by stakeholder meetings. The stakeholder meetings took part throughout the journey of the analysis.

Mentoring in an intercultural context

Drawing on Eby's definition (2010: 505), we see mentoring here as 'a developmentally oriented interpersonal relationship that is typically between a more experienced individual (i.e., the mentor) and a less experienced individual (i.e. the protégé)'. We decided to use the term mentee since it better reflects our view of mentoring: instead of the more traditional idea of mentoring as a hierarchical relationship we think mentoring should be understood as a dialogue based on equality, interaction and trust. The goal of the process is to meet the mentee's needs, and thus the mentee plays an active role in the dialogue (Law 2013). In an intercultural context, the participants benefit from cultural awareness, which includes cultural self-awareness and situation-specific awareness (Osula & Irvin 2009). The development of intercultural competence demands self-reflective processes to encounter embedded stereotypes, fears and uncertainties, and thereby the tolerance of confusion and complexity – according to Holmes and O'Neill (2012: 717) it 'involves critical cultural awareness of Self and Other in an intercultural encounter, with appropriate attention to relationship building, monitoring and managing emotions, empathy, and facework'.

According to Kram's classic text (1983), the functions of mentoring tasks can be categorised as psychosocial and career enhancing. The psychosocial functions refer to the mentee's experience of self-image and capability being encouraged through role modelling, acceptance, counselling, friendship, and confirmation in the mentoring relationship. The career-enhancing functions refer to actions and activities through which the mentor provides the mentee with sponsorship and coaching, sets challenging assignments, and increases visibility to advance the mentee's career (Allen & Eby 2004). Formal mentoring programmes, which have a systematic approach to mentoring and are frequently used by working life organisations, typically aim to advance the mentees' competences and career and enhance employee retention and workforce diversity (ibid., Eby & Lockwood 2005). The programmes may involve training before and during the mentoring process to clarify both the mentor's and mentee's roles and responsibilities, and to make them feel comfortable with the mentoring process (Eby & Lockwood 2005).

In mentoring research, a dominant interest has revolved around the advantages that mentoring provides participants (Eby et al. 2008, Gentry et al. 2008). For example, mentoring has shown to advance a mentee's self-efficacy, networking and job performance ratings (Kram 1983, Scandura & Williams 2004, Mutanen & Lämsä 2006, Lester et al. 2011). Furthermore, mentoring has the potential to also promote the mentor's career success and personal and job satisfaction (Kram 1983, Allen et al. 2004, Eby et al. 2008). Despite these various important benefits, it is essential to recognise that a mentoring relationship is an interpersonal relationship that is intensive by nature (Kram 1983). Various studies show that unpleasant, conflicting, unexpected and surprising events and outcomes also occur in such relationships (Eby et al. 2000). In general, researchers have largely ignored the negative aspects of mentoring (Scandura 1998, Eby et al. 2000). The 'dark side of mentoring' seems to have become a taboo subject in mentoring discourse (Scandura 1998). However, in line with Duck (1994), instead of a purely black and white division into the positive and negative characteristics of mentoring relationships, it is important to recognise their multiple and complex nature.

The language paradox

The most conspicuous paradox in the mentoring programme was the use of Finnish language as the only 'official' language in the process. The paradox is that, even though learning Finnish was very important for the mentees, having Finnish as the only language in the programme also caused considerable problems for some of the participants. Learning the language of one's new home country is one of the most crucial skills needed for finding employment (Ahmad 2005, Eronen et al. 2014, Jaakkola & Reuter 2007, Nieminen et al. 2015, Tarnanen & Pöyhönen 2011). This is why the language of the mentoring programme was Finnish, despite the fact that some of the mentees did not yet have the skills to use the language in spoken and written forms in the depth required to communicate on issues crucial for working life. For some mentees, the language requirement evoked frustration and other negative emotions. In these contexts, we argue this is not favourable for learning and strengthening the professional self-assurance of the mentees.

The most notable language problems occurred in the joint meetings of the programme. The learning of Finnish and the level of language skills was a frequently discussed topic in these gatherings: the mentees were well aware of the importance of learning Finnish, and the topic kept arising in the discussions. The Finnish language skills of the mentees varied greatly. Some were fluent in speech but expressed a need for more advanced language courses that emphasise written language and details of grammar, since the language requirements in their desired jobs were high. Some other participants could not take part in the discussions at all, because it was difficult for them to understand the presentations of the guest speakers or the organisers, or to effectively follow the discussions. Some could understand most of what was said but found it very hard to express themselves in Finnish. A more critical notion would be to ponder why the reasons for the majority of mentees not taking part in discussions in the general meetings was not addressed. Were the organisers avoiding pressuring the mentees to talk? Was it due to the ideal of efficiency, common in working life in Finland (e.g. Niemi-Kaija 2014)? The visiting organiser's comment was pronounced and spontaneous and could thus be interpreted as an unconscious 'symptom' of the idea of status quo in the power relations (see Koskela 2013; Tuori 2009), maintaining the more knowledgeable and active 'helper' role of the organisers and mentors and passive role of the mentees as parties to be 'helped'. Behtoui et al. (2017) have concluded that in working life contexts, the racialised and less powerful tend to resort to silence rather than voice or exit.

Astrid, who has a PhD from her native country, explained she had difficulties with the language:

> Astrid: Of course, I, it was very, very good that I had to eeh, [try to cope in Finnish] but it was tiresome also. Very fast I had to understand so-

> mething pretty clear [and] I couldn't. I had to have a tablet to translate it. It was multitasking and I am not a multitasker, I am not.

The need to use a tablet computer in order to translate while the speaker was already moving to the next topic felt troublesome and tedious, at least for Astrid. Very few of the interviewed women were as outspoken about their difficulties in understanding what was being said, but the problems were reflected in the general discussions of the joint meetings, in which the mentors and organisers took more part than the mentees. Despite her difficulties, Astrid felt the organisers had a positive attitude: she felt safe and 'could ask anything'. She even went on to say that only in Finland can she feel so free in a meeting: people were joking and were free to say what they were thinking. Based on the ethnographer´s experiences of the meetings, it seems fair to say that the participants felt safe. Most mentees left the gatherings with a hopeful mindset, even though they might not have understood everything that was said.

However, this was not always the case. In most meetings, there was time for all the mentees to tell the group how they were doing and what they were doing with their mentor. On one of these occasions, one mentee mentioned that she had felt very low after a mentor – not her own mentor – had said in the previous joint meeting that her Finnish skills were not good enough for the profession for which she had a university degree from her homeland. This incident was immediately identified as important by the researcher:

> In principle, I agreed with the mentor, since the mentee's profession involves knowing details in complicated texts and being able to correctly find different interpretations of literary expressions. On the other hand, this mentee, like many foreign-born women I have met during the course of this research, underestimate the level of their language skills and are often too modest. Yet in this case the mentor had a point as regards the particular job the mentee was applying for. However, she expressed this view in such a blunt way that the mentee felt thoroughly dispirited and told us she left the meeting with tears in her eyes: *'In the last meeting there was a mentor who was sounding off that everyone needs to learn Finnish. I felt like going away to cry. Always the same thing, even here.'* The strict language requirements felt particularly unfair, even cruel, in the light of the long waiting lists for language courses, and the lack of higher-level Finnish courses (Field note diary).

On one occasion, the organisers of the programme also pushed the use of Finnish to an extent that could have discouraged the mentees. In the kick-off meeting of the second observed mentoring group, the mentors and mentees had just met for the first time to get to know each other and discuss the process that was about to start.

> The dyads had spread out in the venue of the first meeting. Two dyads stayed in the meeting room in which I was chatting with one of the organisers and a representative [of another NGO that offers a similar kind of mentoring] who had given a presentation at the beginning of the gathering. In the middle of our chat, this [other NGO's] expert shouted to the other end of the room where the two mentoring dyads were concentrating on the initial discussions, telling them to speak Finnish. The power relations were further highlighted by the fact that we were standing up and looking down at the mentoring dyads, sitting down in relaxed positions (Field note diary).

The suspense was discharged by one of the mentors replying with a serious expression that they had decided that using English was the best solution for now. The other dyad simply continued their discussions in English without even responding. The other NGO has stricter language requirements than this observed programme, which makes the expert's comment understandable. Language can only be learned if it is used and the learner should exploit every possibility to use it. However, in this programme, the language skills of the mentees differed greatly, and it was clear that some of the mentees were not able to carry out the programme in Finnish. The sudden requirement of speaking Finnish may thus result in some of the mentees feeling shut out – a result that is contradictory to the aim of the programme to promote the inclusion of the mentees in Finnish society. Therefore, this could be seen as a situation that contradicts everything that mentoring stands for.

In her interview, Ann questioned the emphasis on the use of Finnish language in the dyad. To her it was an inconvenience and made her career aspirations progress slower, even though she fully recognised the importance of learning Finnish. Ann said she was happy that she and her mentor could speak the same language: according to her, this made their discussions 'fast and more efficient'.

> Ann: In my opinion, the person should be in the centre [of the process] so that it really moves forward.
>
> Interviewer: So, the mentee should be in the centre?
>
> Ann: Yes, she and her working life. Not learning the language. That will follow automatically, if she gets a job.

In the one-to-one mentoring relationship, the dyads were able to choose ways in which to communicate more freely. Several mentoring dyads chose to speak English or another common (native) language, but some used Finnish throughout the process. Still, none of the interviewed mentees mentioned any improvement in their Finnish language skills as a result of the mentoring, although some said that the opportunity to practise Finnish was a positive thing. Myrtle described the challenges of working strictly in Finnish in the programme from a mentor's point of view.

She was aware of the importance of Finnish for the mentee but pointed out that teaching Finnish and the complex issues of job-seeking and careers at the same time was too great a task. She also questioned these strict language requirements. Implicitly, Myrtle highlighted that the over-ambitious language requirements had resulted in another disappointment and exclusion of at least one of the mentees who 'could not cope' and quit the mentoring process because she did not know enough Finnish. Myrtle brought up this criticism of the programme while talking about the tasks and the role of the mentor. She stated that the mentor's role is to listen to the mentee and respect their wishes throughout the mentoring process. She concluded that although it is possible to guide, you cannot force the mentee to do anything. By enforcing the use of Finnish in the mentoring process, the mentor also maintained her status as the more knowledgeable and competent member of the mentoring dyad.

Mollie, who is a professional career coach, decided to have the discussions with her mentee in English, but expected the mentee to provide some job-seeking related texts in Finnish. Mollie herself was from a Swedish-speaking family, and instead of pointing out the importance of Finnish, she emphasised that she hoped she could help her mentee identify her fields of expertise, her strengths and her potential, so that the she could then verbalise to employers who she is and what she is capable of. Mollie seemed to feel the need to apologise for her decision to use English in the discussions with her mentee but justified the language choice by saying that mentoring was much more effective this way. She highlighted that she wanted to start the dyadic process by enabling her mentee to assert her self-esteem. In Mollie's case, effectiveness can be seen as a culturally acceptable reason to use English instead of Finnish.

The support paradox

Despite the common instructions and the mentoring agreement signed by both mentor and mentee, the participants had varying expectations of the mentoring process and its implications. Some of these inconsistent expectations and practices can be seen as contradictory elements which we have compiled here as the support paradox. This paradox is based on the contradiction of the mentor taking an excessively enthusiastic role in the interaction: this enables and even encourages the mentee to take a passive, withdrawn role.

Several mentees highlighted that 'fixing' the mentee's CV was one of the mentor's most important tasks. In at least two cases, the mentor actually wrote up the mentee's CV, although in most cases the mentor preferred to comment on the document, which the mentee improved and finalised herself. Improving a CV is indeed an important step and help from someone who is familiar with current recruitment processes can be a decisive factor in presenting the job-seeker in an effective way. Nevertheless, if the mentee herself is not the subject of the process but merely a receiver of a ready-made list of career details, she will still lack CV-making skills after the mentoring process is over. This might even result in an awkward situation for the mentee if, in the recruitment process it emerges that she does not possess the word processing skills that were needed to make the CV, for instance. Thus paradoxically, the much-needed help provided by the mentor does not always advance the mentee's capabilities and independence.

Some of the interviewed mentees had very high expectations of the mentoring process. They expected the mentor to be a professional from their own occupation, someone who could give them a job or at least a training position. For example, Alice had a positive attitude towards the mentoring but said it was too general for her. She wanted the mentor to concretely arrange a job for her, by for instance, inviting her for training or a work trial at her own workplace.

> Alice: It would be good if the pair was made up from people who have the same profession or the same background or that the mentor already works in the institution where the mentee would like to work. Then, the mentor could invite the mentee for practical training or a work trial. That way, the mentee could practice first and build some networks too.

The mentoring contract states that it is not the mentor's task to find a job for the mentee – thus avoiding the mentee taking on the role of a 'protégée'. In this sense, Alice's wish seems unrealistic, although organising training or the possibility of a work trial can be seen as different to finding a 'proper' job. Alice was the only mentee who said so openly that she expected this. She highlighted the importance of the mentor being, if possible, from the same occupation as the mentee. This was also the wish of other mentees and some mentors.

In practice, the organisers had very limited resources for trying to find mentors. Indeed, most of the mentoring dyads could be seen as practising 'general' career mentoring with overarching goals, as Mollie, Alice's mentor, described in the previous section. In her interview, Mollie said she was pleased to see Alice 'start to bloom' during the mentoring process. Mollie used blooming as a symbol for the process in which Alice's self-esteem grew through her increased self-knowledge. The paradoxical aspect here is that Alice might not have been able to utilise any opportunities provided by a mentor from her own occupation until she regained her self-assurance. This is a two-fold argument. Firstly, self-doubt after a longer period of unemployment can make it difficult to tell even someone with the same occupation about your skills and abilities. Sometimes an 'outsider' can also see the job-seekers' opportunities through a wider scope, not only within the shared occupation (which might not deliver as many possibilities, for instance, because of language requirements). Secondly, if the mentee is not sure what she wants from her working life or from the mentoring process, the mentor might not be able to help, whatever their occupation.

In two cases, the mentees had difficulties following 'assignments' such as amending their CV, in the way their mentors would have liked them to. One of these mentees fell ill during the mentoring process and another began to study. Nevertheless, they both blamed themselves explicitly for being lazy or implicitly for being incapable of meeting the requirements of the mentor and the job market. Observation of the group discussions made it clear that some mentees had mixed feelings about being helped by a mentor. Some said the mentor was the more active part of the dyad: they seemed to feel uncomfortable about this, as they knew that the mentee should actually be the carrier of the process. It remains unclear whether the professional background of the mentee had anything to do with the difficulties they experienced. Before becoming unemployed, both these interviewed mentees had years of experience in occupations in which they had worked as therapists. It is possible that part of their difficulties was born from the paradox of now being the helped instead of the helper. In some discussions with the mentors, a sense of disappointment emerged about the mentee not being more active and making the collaboratively planned changes to their CV, for example. This mentee reluctance is in parallel with Colley's (2003) finding regarding the power of the mentee: the mentees were not passive recipients of mentor support, but exercised their own agency and resistance, although with contradictory results.

Improving mentoring through a paradox analysis

Through our analysis, we interpreted two paradoxes in the studied mentoring programmes: the language paradox, and the 'clustered' support paradox. Both paradoxes have cyclical dynamics which are easier to control when they are identified.

The detected language paradox maps out the enabling and restricting aspects of using Finnish as the only 'official' language in the studied programmes. Using the Finnish language fosters the improvement of the mentees' vital language skills. At the same time, when the mentee's Finnish language skills are somewhat deficient, the situation becomes constraining and can create a vicious circle of negative experiences for the mentee: negative experiences are harmful to the mentee's self-esteem, and this feeling of inadequacy may even force them to use the Finnish language which, in turn, causes further negative experiences. Culturally, the language paradox is based on the strong position of the Finnish language in Finland. Almost nine out of ten people in Finland speak Finnish as their first language. Finnish as a language is strongly connected to Finland becoming an independent state and, as in many other countries, there is a strong link between language and identity (e. g. Koivunen 2012). Fears about the extinction of Finnish are often currently expressed in the press. Based on this research, many 'immigrant' job-seekers are keen to learn Finnish (see also Nieminen et al. 2015, 54). In the mentoring process, talking about career goals, occupational skills or other complicated matters in another, situationally more functional, language should not be a concern. In line with Osula & Irvin (2009), we suggest that especially in an intercultural context, the mentor should be careful when correcting the mentee or challenging their aspirations, to avoid questioning the security of their relationship.

Learning a new language is a complicated and multifaceted process. For an adult, it is a challenge that typically requires a great deal of time, practice, repetition, motivation, and opportunities to exercise the language (Perdue 1993: 254–270, Sudhershan 2014). The Finnish language is exceptional compared to most of its neighbouring countries' languages and other European languages: its vocabulary is idiosyncratic and its structures are considered complex, making it relatively difficult to learn (Tarnanen & Pöyhönen 2011). Learning a new language often requires intensity, which a mentoring relationship can rarely provide due to the fact that a mentoring dyad, as was the case in the studied programme, usually only meets once or twice a month. Thus, mentoring targeted at supporting job-seeking is not really a language course.

Based on the findings of this study, we suggest that to avoid a negative cycle, the organisers of mentoring programmes for foreign-born people should select the participants for the programme carefully: the required level of language skills should be defined beforehand and the participants' language skills should be evaluated before their recruitment. In addition, mentoring programmes such as that studied here would benefit from some practical educational tools that combine Finnish studies, knowledge of the Finnish labour market and job-seeking in Finland. For example, the participants may benefit from language learning tools that they could use independently at home, including inspiration for how to take advantage of surrounding learning material (websites, newspapers, books, podcasts, radio, television).

Furthermore, the organisers could consider the possibility of including a person in the mentoring process who explains the principles and contents of mentoring to the participants in plain Finnish. A study by Lähdesmäki and Savela (2006) of immigrants' entrepreneurship training found that having a plain language Finnish instructor, in addition to a content teacher, was very useful for the participants. It increased their chances of understanding the teaching and the training programme gave them benefits for their entrepreneurial career. Since mentees with more advanced language skills might find this practice demotivating, testing the participants' language skills to ensure that they are at approximately the same level would eliminate this problem. In general, we believe that more research and practical elaboration of the advancement of various developmental methods in mentoring processes is needed. Digital technologies may offer solutions that could be further studied in the future (see, for instance, Velghe & Blommaert 2014).

The support paradox is a cluster of aspects around the interplay between the mentor, the mentee and the mentoring programme itself. In this paradox, the mentee is positioned on the one hand as an object of the mentor's direction, help and instructions, which, according to Standing (1999), resembles the authoritative way of mentoring and emphasises the hierarchical relationship between a mentee and mentor. From this point of view, the studied mentoring programme may have a constraining effect on the mentee in the long run in terms of her development as an active and self-imposed job-seeker. Interestingly, in our study, both the mentee and the mentor used and expected this kind of mentoring which, being very instrumental (see Kram 1983) and ad-hoc by nature, may occasionally be helpful in a specific critical situation (for example, writing a cv for the mentee). However, in the long run, this kind of relationship is problematic, because it does not effectively support the mentees' own learning and growth of her development and skills, which are crucial aims not only in the programmes studied but in mentoring processes in general (Kram 1983, Scandura & Williams 2004, Eby & Lockwood 2005, Eby 2010, Lester et al. 2011).

Culturally, the overpowering attitude of the mentor can be linked to the myth of 'the strong Finnish woman'. In addition to being physically and mentally strong (Koivunen 2003, Markkola 2002, Tuori 2009), especially during and after the Second World War, Finnish women were expected to accept great personal losses without showing grief in public, while at the same time public expressions of joy and happiness were also disapproved of due to the nation's losses (Koivunen 2003, Olsson 2011). The cultural practices of concealing one's feelings are still very much visible in, for example, national festivals and inexpressive international sport stars. In the context of mentoring, the combination of the ideas of being strong, fact-focused and not showing your feelings can sometimes result in bluntness, which can easily be interpreted as non-empathetic and unsupportive.

On the other hand, in the support paradox, both the mentor and the mentee also position the mentee as an active subject in the relationship. Such a mentoring relationship refers to the empowerment and active development of the mentee as regards her skills and other capabilities (Lester et al. 2011). The mentoring literature labels this kind of orientation a caring relationship between the mentee and mentor (Colley 2003, Mutanen & Lämsä 2006). Such a relationship can be regarded as a more enabling factor for the mentee's job-seeking than merely being given instructions on what to do.

In line with Lester and colleagues (2011), despite the argument that formal mentoring is not as efficient as informal mentoring (for example Eby & Lockwood 2005), the results of our study indicate that formal mentoring can be helpful. It can support the mentee's – in this study, foreign-born, female mentees – capabilities to become more efficient and self-directed in job-seeking. Moreover, we think that formal mentoring programmes also present a way to include people other than officials in the process of 'integration', the mentors' networks making it more diverse and possibly more effective. It is possible that the positive results of the mentoring programmes here, as well as in general (Allen & Eby 2004, Eby & Lockwood 2005, Lester et al. 2011), may be linked to the proactivity of people who seek to take part in the programmes as mentees. Like the foreign-born women in this study, they are likely to be motivated and active, which generally helps them progress in working life. All in all, we suggest that despite its complex and paradoxical nature, formal mentoring has the potential to offer support that can boost the progress of foreign-born women in working life, specifically in job-seeking.

At the beginning of this article, we set ourselves the task of exploring the cultural practices and ideas visible in our sources in an 'intercultural' mentoring programme. Using the paradox frame as a lens, our interpretation is that the most significant cultural meanings were the over-emphasised focus on the Finnish language (the language paradox), and the myth of the strong Finnish woman (the support paradox). These can be seen to have aspects of both cultural awareness and situation-specific awareness (Osula & Irvin 2009). Using situation-specific awareness, some mentors understood that it was best to break the rules of the mentoring programme and not use Finnish in all their communications, enabling a more equal setting for professional discussions. In some cases, when the mentors failed to use situation-specific awareness, the mentees felt even worse about their abilities and working life opportunities. Similarly, the myth of the strong Finnish woman can be an empowering and positive model for the mentee, but can have a negative impact on the mentor, enabling undercurrents in the mentoring discussions which may be perceived as harsh and even hostile. Instead of encouraging and supporting, this may result in undermining and 'othering' the mentee.

Acknowledgements

This research was funded by the Strategic Research Council of the Academy of Finland, the Social and Economic Sustainability of Future Working Life (WeAll) Consortium (project number 292883). We would like to thank the editors and the anonymous reviewers of this article for their valuable comments.

Tytti Steel is a Postdoctoral Researcher at the Department of Cultures, University of Helsinki. Her research interests include working life and employment, especially from the point of view of minorities and people who have difficulties in finding employment. She works in an Academy of Finland (Strategic Research Council) funded research project (WeAll) on socially and economically sustainable future working life. E-mail: tytti.steel@helsinki.fi

Anna-Maija Lämsä is Professor of Human Resource Management and Vice Dean at the University of Jyväskylä, School of Business and Economics, Finland. Her research interests are organizational and leadership ethics, and equality and diversity in organizational life. Her research is published widely both internationally and nationally. She is currently co-director and principal investigator in the program Equality in Society (WeAll No. 292 883) by strategic research funding of the Academy of Finland.

Marjut Jyrkinen is Associate Professor in Working Life Equality and Gender Studies, University of Helsinki, and director of research consortium on sustainable working life (weallfinland.fi), funded by the Strategic Research Council at the Academy of Finland. Jyrkinen has studied gendered violence and violations in and outside organizations, leadership, and gendered ageism. Her latest book, with Elina Penttinen and Elisabeth Wide, is Emotional Workplace Abuse: A New Research Approach, published in 2019 by Palgrave MacMillan.

Notes

[1]We use the words migrant and foreign-born as synonyms to a person with foreign background, as defined by the Statistics Finland (http://www.stat.fi/meta/kas/ulkomaalaistaus_en.html).
[2] In a previous project analysing interviews of female refugees (Steel & Tuori 2016), it became clear that focusing on the journey to Finland and immigrant identity moves the emphasis away from working life issues.
[3]For more on the fluid boundaries of analysis in research processes see, for instance, O'Dell & Willim 2011.
[4]Finland has two main national languages: Finnish (88,3%) and Swedish (5,3%); offi-

cial minority languages are three variants of Sami, Romani, Finnish Sign Language, and Karelian. The most spoken other languages are Russian, Estonian, English, and Arabic.

Interviews

The audio recordings and transcriptions of the interviews and the field notes are currently in the possession of the WeAll Research Consortium at the University of Helsinki. In the future, the anonymised transcriptions will be archived in the Finnish Science Data Archive.

Presentation of interviewees

Pseudonym	Age group	Background	Job market situation
Alice	30–39	European*	Pay subsidy job
Ann	50–59	European	Entrepreneur and job-seeker
Astrid	40–49	European	Job-seeker with a few hours of work per week
Audrey	50–59	South-American	Pay subsidy job
Ava	50–60	European	Studying
Mary	50–59	European	Full-time employment
Melanie	30–39	Finnish	Full-time employment
Mia	20–29	European	Full-time employment
Mollie	60–69	Finnish	Entrepreneur
Myrtle	60–69	Finnish	Retired
Nancy	40–50	Finnish	Full-time employment (NGO)

* other than Finnish; by European we mean the geographical area of Europe including western parts of Russia

Literature

Aalto, Maria, Liisa Larja & Karmela Liebkind (2010): *Syrjintä työhönottotilanteissa: tutkimuskatsaus*. Työ- ja elinkeinoministeriön julkaisuja, Työ ja yrittäjyys 16/2010. Helsinki: Ministry of Employment and the Economy.
Ahmad, Akhlaq (2005): *Getting a Job in Finland: The Social Networks of Immigrants from the Indian Subcontinent in the Helsinki Metropolitan Labour Market*. Research Reports No. 247, Department of Sociology. Helsinki: University of Helsinki.
Ahlfors, Gunta, Inka Saarela, Sari Vahanen & Marina Wetzer-Karlsson (N. d.): *Työuramentoroinnilla tuloksiin*. Helsinki: Väestöliitto.
Allen, Tammy D. & Eby, Lillian T. (2004): "Factors related to mentor reports of mentoring functions provided: Gender and relational characteristics." *Sex Roles*, 50(1/2), 129-139.
Allen, Tammy D., Lillian T. Eby, Mark L. Poteet & Lizzette Lima (2004): "Career Benefits Associated with Mentoring for Protégés: A Meta-Analysis." *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 89(1), 127–136.
Behtoui, Alireza, Kristina Boréus, Anders Neergaard, Soheyla Yazdanpanah (2016): "Speaking up, leaving or keeping silent: racialised employees in the Swedish elderly care sector." *Work, employment and society*, Vol 31(6), 954–971.
Bhabha, Homi K. (1994/2003): *The Location of Culture*. London: Routledge.
Cameron, Kim S. & Robert E. Quinn (1998): "Organizational paradox and transformation." Robert E. Quinn & Kim S. Cameron (Eds.) *Paradox and transformation: Toward a theory of change in organization and management*, 1–18. Cambridge, M.A: Ballinger.
Casado-Lumbreras, Cristina, Ricardo Colomo-Palacios, Pedro Soto-Acosta & Sanjay Misra (2011): "Culture dimensions in software development industry: The effects of mentoring." *Scientific Research and Essays*, 6(11), 2403-2412.
Colley, Helen (2003): *Mentoring for Social Inclusion: a critical approach to nurturing mentor relationships*. London: RoutledgeFalmer.
Cooper, Peter A. (1993): "Paradigm Shifts in Designed Instruction: From Behaviorism to Cognitivism to Constructivism." *Educational Technology* 33:5, 12-19.
Duck, Steve (1994): "Strategems, spoils, and a serpent's tooth: On the delights and dilemmas of personal relationships." William R. Cupach & Brian H. Spitzberg (Eds.), *The dark side of interpersonal communication*. Hillsdale, NJ: Erlbaum, 3–24.
Eby, Lillian T. (2010): "Mentorship." Sheldon Zedack (Ed.), *APA handbook of industrial and organizational psychology*. Washington, D.C.: American Psychological Association, 505-525.
Eby, Lillian T. & Angie Lockwood (2005): "Protégés and mentors' reactions to paticipating in formal mentoring programs: A qualitative investigation." *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 67, 441–458
Eby, Lillian T., Stacy E. McManus, Shana A. Simon & Joyce E. A. Russell (2000): "The protege's perspective regarding negative mentoring experiences: The development of a taxonomy." *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 57, 1–21.
Eby, Lillian T., Tammy D. Allen, Sarah C. Evans, Thomas Ng & David L. Dubois (2008): "Does mentoring matter? A multi-disciplinary meta-analysis comparing mentored and non-mentored individuals." *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 72, 254-267.
Elmgren, Ainur (2016): "Förfinskandet av Finland." Mats Wickström & Charlotta Wulff (eds.) *Mångkulturalitet, migration och minoriteter I Finland under tre sekel*. Helsinki: The Society of Swedish Literature in Finland, 319–354.
Eronen, Antti, Valtteri Härmälä, Signe Jauhiainen, Hanna Karikallio, Risto Karinen, Antti Kosunen, Jani-Petri Laamanen & Markus Lahtinen (2014): *Maahanmuuttajien työllistyminen: Taustatekijät, työnhaku ja työvoimapalvelut*. Työ- ja elinkeinominis-

teriön julkaisuja. Työ ja yrittäjyys. 6/2014. Helsinki: Työ- ja elinkeinoministeriö.
European Agency for Fundamental Rights (2018): *Being Black in the EU: Second European Union Minorities and Discrimination Survey*. Luxemburg: Publications Office of the European Union.
Fangen, Katrine (2005): *Deltagande observation*. Malmö: Liber.
Fägerborg, Eva (1999): "Intervjuer." Lars Kaijser & Magnus Öhlander (Eds.) *Etnologiskt fältarbete*. Lund: Studentlitteratur, 55–72.
Gentry, William A., Todd J. Weber & Golnaz Sadri (2008): "Examining career-related mentoring and managerial performance across cultures: A multi-level analysis." *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 72, 241-253.
Hennik, Monique, Inge Hutter & Ajay Bailey(2011): *Qualitative Research Methods*. London: Sage.
Holmes, Prue & Gillian O'Neill (2012): "Developing and evaluating intercultural competence: Ethnographies of intercultural encounters." *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, 36, 707-718.
Jaakkola, Magdalena & Anni Reuter (2007): "Maahanmuuttajanaiset entisen Neuvostoliiton alueelta: Resurssit ja sijoittuminen työmarkkinoille." Tuomas Martikainen & Marja Tiilikainen (Eds.) *Maahanmuuttajanaiset: Kotoutuminen, perhe ja työ*. Väestöntutkimuslaitoksen julkaisusarja D 46/2007. Helsinki: Väestöliitto, The Family Federation of Finland, 335-358.
Kanniainen, Minna-Rosa, Nylund, Jaana & Kupias, Päivi (2017): *Workbook for Mentoring*. Helsinki: University of Helsinki.
Kent, Andrea M., Frances Kochan & Andre M. Green (2013): "Cultural influences on mentoring programs and relationships: a critical review of research", *International Journal of Mentoring and Coaching in Education*, Vol. 2 No. 3, pp. 204-217. https://doi.org/10.1108/IJMCE-08-2013-0047
Kinnunen, Sari (2013): *Womento: Koulutettujen Suomeen muuttaneiden naisten kokemuksia työuramentoroinnista*. Helsinki: Metropolia Ammattikorkeakoulu.
Knuuttila, Seppo (1996): "Yhtenäiskulttuuri kansallisena kertomuksena". In Pekka Laaksonen & Sirkka-Liisa Mettomäki (eds.) *Olkaamme siis suomalaisia*. Helsinki: Finnish Literature Society, 166–175.
Koivunen, Anu (2003): *Performative Histories, Foundational Fictions. Gender and Sexuality in Niskavuori Films*. Studia Fennica Historica 7. Helsinki: Suomalaisen Kirjallisuuden Seura.
Koivunen, Anu (2012): "Kansa liikkeessä." Anu Koivunen (ed.) *Maailman paras maa*. Suomalaisen Kirjallisuuden Seuran Toimituksia 1362, Tieto. Helsinki: Finnish Literature Society, 7–27.
Koskela, Kaisu (2013): "Boundaries of Belonging: Highly Skilled Migrants and the Migrant Hierarchy in Finland." *Journal of Finnish Studies* Vol. 17, No. 1& 2 (Dec 2013), 19–41.
Kram, Kathy E. (1983): "Phases of the mentoring relationship." *Academy of Management Journal*, 26, 608-625.
KVINFO website http://kvinfo.org/ (Accessed 21 July 2017)
Kyhä, Henna (2006): "Miksi lääkäri ei kelpaa lääkäriksi? Korkeakoulutetut maahanmuuttajat Suomen työmarkkinoilla." *Aikuiskasvatus*, 26(2), 122–129.
Law, Ho (2013): *The Psychology of Coaching, Mentoring and Learning*. Malden, MA: John Wiley & Sons Inc.
Lester, Paul B., Sean T. Hannah, P. D. Harms, Gretchen R. Vogelgesang & Bruce J. Avolio (2011): "Mentoring impact on leader efficacy development: A field experiment." *Academy of Management Learning & Education*, 10(3), 409–429.
Lewis, Marianne W. (2000): "Exploring Paradox: Toward a More Comprehensive Guide." *The Academy of Management Review*, Vol. 25, No. 4 (Oct 2000), 760–776.
Lähdesmäki, Merja & Terttu Savela (2006): *Tutkimus maahanmuuttajien yrittäjyyskoulutuksen vaikuttavuudesta: Case Pro Maahanmuuttajayrittäjä -koulutus*. Oulun

seudun ammattikorkeakoulu & Siirtolaisuusinstituutti.
Markkola, Pirjo (2002): ”Vahva nainen ja kansallinen historia.” Tuula Gordon & Katri Komulainen & Kirsti Lempiäinen (eds.), *Suomineitonen hei! Kansallisuuden sukupuoli*. Tampere: Vastapaino. 75–90.
Mutanen,Sanna & Lämsä, Anna-Maija (2006): ”Mentoroinnin merkitykset naisten urakehitykselle.” *Hallinnon tutkimus* 25(2006):4, 19–32.
National Advisory Board on Research Ethics (2009): *Ethical principles of research in the humanities and social and behavioural sciences and proposals for ethical review*. http://www.tenk.fi/en/tenk-guidelines (Accessed 21 July 2017).
Niemi-Kaija, Kristiina (2014): *Kokemuksellisuus työelämässä organisaatioestetiikan viitekehyksessä: työntekijöiden subjektiiviset konstruktiot tehokkuudesta*. Jyväskylä Studies in Business and Economics 153. Jyväskylä: Jyväskylän yliopisto.
Nieminen, Tarja, Hanna Sutela & Ulla Hannula (2015): *Ulkomaista syntyperää olevien työ ja hyvinvointi Suomessa 2014*. Helsinki: Tilastokeskus.
O'Dell, Thomas & Robert Willim (2011): "Composing Ethnography." *Ethnologia Europaea* 41:1, 27–40.
OECD (2018): Working Together: Skills and Labour Market Integration of Immigrants and their Children in Finland. Paris: OECD Publishing. https://doi.org/10.1787/9789264305250-en
Olsson, Pia 2011*: Women in Distress: Self-understanding among 20th-century rural women*. European Studies in Culture and Policy. Vol 11. Wien: LIT Verlag.
Osula, Bramwell & Steve M. Irvin (2009): "Cultural Awareness in Intercultural Mentoring: A Model for Enhancing Mentoring Relationships." *International Journal of Leadership Studies*, Vol. 5 Issue 1, 37–50.
Perdue, Clive (ed.) (1993): *Adult Language acquisition: cross-linguistic perspectives*. Written by members of the European Science Foundation project on adult language acquisition. Volume II: The results. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
Petrovic, Milica 2015: *Mentoring practices in Europe and North America: Strategies for improving immigrants' employment outcomes*. Brussels: King Baudouin Foundation.
Povrzanović Frykman, Maja (2012): "Struggle for Recognition: Bosnian Refugees' Employment Experiences in Sweden." *Refugee Survey Quarterly*, Vol. 31, No. 1, 54–79.
Scandura, Terri A. (1998): "Dysfunctional mentoring relationships and outcomes." *Journal of Management*, 24, 3: 449–467.
Scandura, Terri A. & Williams, Ethlyn A. (2004): "Mentoring and transformational leadership: The role of supervisory career mentoring." J*ournal of vocational behavior* 65:3, 448–468. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jvb.2003.10.003
Schad, Jonathan, Marianne W. Lewis, Sebastian Raisch & Wendy K. Smith (2016): "Paradox Research in Management Science: Looking Back to Move Forward." *The Academy of Management Annals*, 10:1, 5–64.
Standing, Mooi (1999): "Developing a Supportive/Challenging and Reflective/Competency Education (SCARCE) mentoring model and discussing its relevance to nurse education." *Mentoring and Tutoring* 6 (3) 3-17.
Statistics Finland (2019): Concepts, foreign background http://www.stat.fi/meta/kas/ulkomaalaistaus_en.html (accessed 27 June 2019).
Steel, Tytti & Tuori, Annamari (2016): "'Olenko minä niin eksoottinen?': Pakolaistaustaisten naisten työelämään liittyvä identiteettityö." *Elore* 23:2, 1–25.
Sudhershan, Aleksandra (2014): "E-Portfolio Self-Assessment of Intercultural Communicative Competence: Helping Language Learners to Become Autonomous Intercultural Speakers." Barbara Geraghty & Jean E. Conacher (Eds) *Intercultural Contact, Language Learning and Migration*, 150–165. London: Bloomsbury.
Sundaramurthy, Chamu & Lewis, Marianne (2003): "Control and Collaboration: Paradoxes of governance." *Academy of Management Review* 2003, Vol. 28, No. 3,

397–415.
Tarnanen, Mirja & Pöyhönen Sari (2011): ”Maahanmuuttajien suomen kielen taidon riittävyys ja työllistymisen mahdollisuudet.” *Puhe ja kieli* 31:4, 139–152.
The Family Federation of Finland, *Womento avaa uusia väyliä koulutettujen maahan muuttaneiden naisten työllistymiseen*. http://www.vaestoliitto.fi/monikulttuurisuus/?x29403=2036985 (Accessed 19 July 2017).
Tuori, Salla (2009): *The Politics of Multicultural Encounters: Feminist Postcolonial Perspectives*. Turku: Åbo Akademi University Press.
Velghe, Fie & Jan Blommaert (2014): "Emergent New Literacies and the Mobile Phone: Informal Language Learning, Voice and Identity in a South African Township." Barbara Geraghty & Jean E. Conacher (Eds) *Intercultural Contact, Language Learning and Migration*, 89–111. London: Bloomsbury.
Wolanik Boström, Katarzyna & Magnus Öhlander (2011): ”Polska läkare i Sverige: Om läkarroll, status och kulturella processer.” *Socialmedicinsk tidskrift* 3/2011, 273–281.